

## Reviews

**Aikin**, Judith P., *A Ruler's Consort in Early Modern Germany: Aemilia Juliana of Schwarzburg-Rudolstadt* (Women and Gender in the Early Modern World), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 254; 30 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472423849.

Early modern culture made a sharp distinction between public and private spheres, and as women rarely had a role in the public sphere their function until recently was largely ignored by historians whose interests were tightly focused on the public. Two decades of investigation into the private sphere have now cast considerable light on what women did and its significance. While the formal expectations of a royal consort could be deduced from the occasional reference to women's actions in contemporary narrative accounts, careful examination of the duller court records have enabled historians to analyse the substantive role in which consorts were trained and expected to perform. The opening of the East German record offices after 1989 has meant that researchers like Judith Aikin have been able to carry these investigations into the many smaller courts and countries – once part of the Holy Roman Empire – that had previously been inaccessible to researchers. These investigations show both a general similarity to the role of the consort in more Western courts and a number of differences that relate to the size and expectations of the different areas.

Aemilia Juliana, wife of Albert Anton, Count of Schwarzburg-Rudolstadt, is an exceptionally valuable subject not only because her more mundane activities can be recovered, but so also – because she was one of the great poets of late seventeenth-century Germany – can her thoughts and views. Aikin has recovered from Aemilia's voluminous, specific and detailed writings the views that she chose to express about her life.

The otherwise modest court of Schwarzburg-Rudolstadt was a centre of the literary Muses with its own playwrights, artists, musicians, and even scientists, and Aikin is able to recreate many of the events that Aemilia experienced. In her discussion of the process by which her marriage was arranged and celebrated with plays, music, sonnets, banquets, and other performances, she is able to demonstrate how the ideas of the *Querelle des Femmes* were exploited in deference to Aemilia. Later, she gives a vivid impression of daily life in a busy court as it moved from place to place, entertained guests, both welcome and unpopular, and kept in touch with friends and neighbours.

Aikin warns readers that the cultural norms of Aemilia's period are very different from those with which even committed Christians can empathise today, and despite the careful and lengthy translations of hymns of praise and sorrow she provides, it is hard for readers to put themselves in Aemilia's place and understand what she found satisfactory about her role as a partner – a full partner but not an identical one – as she only acted in the public sphere in an unofficial way. In part, this is because we get little impression of what her husband's political role as the count of a small state inside the Holy Roman Empire involved. Both were deeply pious Lutherans who promoted a daily religious hour, formal prayers, and household prayer meetings.

The couple were publicly modest – Anton turned down the emperor's first attempt to raise him to princely rank – but this did not deflect them from the public demonstration of their own lineage and standing or sense of their position in the wider world. For Aemilia, Aikin shows, this meant a commitment to assisting her subjects and especially the women. She became a focus for a variety of feminine networks, both local and at a distance, and her letters reveal the ways in which women near and far shared support and information. Having received an excellent education in making medicines of all sorts, Aemilia's court, already well known for its theology, became a centre for medical knowledge and especially for the most up-to-date understandings of pregnancy, childbirth, and childcare. The works she produced to this end, with their emphasis on hymns and prayer, as well as more practical advice, became well known and widely used. She promoted women's education at all levels and by all the means at her disposal. Her ideas on teaching were humane and rational, forbidding harsh punishment and humiliation.

The aspect of her life that may cast most light on the nature of German culture at the time is her long obsession with death and her legacy to the world. Her arrangements for her funeral and burial began many years before her death; images and detailed funereal texts were established and altered, designed to represent the beliefs that she had followed through her life.

This readable work would be an excellent introduction for anyone interested in women's history.

SYBIL M. JACK, *The University of Sydney*

**Allaire**, Gloria, and F. Regina **Psaki**, eds, *The Arthur of the Italians: The Arthurian Legend in Medieval Italian Literature and Culture* (Arthurian Literature in the Middle Ages), Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 2014, hardback; pp. 352; R.R.P. £80.00; ISBN 9781783160501.

In the twelfth century, Alanus de Insulis is said to have asked: 'Whither has not flying fame spread and familiarised the name of Arthur the Briton, even as far as the empire of Christendom extends? ... Rome, queen of cities, sings his deeds.' But, while what is possibly the earliest sculpted depiction

of an incident from the Arthuriad appears on the early twelfth-century archivolt of the Porta della Pescheria – the northern portal of the Cathedral of Modena in northern Italy – the study of the Arthurian literature of the Italian peninsula has hardly been a fair field full of folk. As the last such full-length study appeared more than eighty years ago, Allaire and Psaki's volume is especially welcome.

Psaki's Introduction explains in part the reasons for the Anglophone neglect of the Arthur of the Italian peninsula. Italian Arthuriana developed much later than the Arthuriana of the British Isles and of more northern continental Europe, and linguistic traditions in Italian territories in the early Middle Ages were complicated as those territories were inhabited by native speakers of Greek, Arabic, Hebrew, and French, all of whom shared Latin as their *lingua franca*. Thus some of the earliest, albeit fragmentary, Italian Arthurian texts were in fact not written in a dialect of Italian but in Hebrew and Greek. However, it was from French that Italian Arthuriana really developed.

Fittingly then, the first four essays here discuss 'the interface between French and Italian lands in the spread of Arthurian matter' (p. 2). Keith Busby's essay shows just how early texts by Chrétien de Troyes exerted an influence on peninsular writing. Fabrizio Cigni shifts critical attention from the copying to the composing of French texts in Italy with particular attention to the Arthurian Compilation written in French sometime after 1270. Marie-José Heijkant surveys Italian versions of the Tristan story written in both French and Italian, which in turn cemented Tristan's status as the most popular Arthurian character in the Italian tradition. Daniela Delcorono Branca concludes this section of Allaire and Psaki's volume with a discussion of *La Tavola Ritonda*, 'the only real Arthurian romance of the Italian Middle Ages ... [and] a holistic attempt to assemble into a single romance the entire Arthurian cycle, from Uther Pendragon to the *Mort Artu*, with Tristan as its focus' (p. 69).

The Arthur of the Italians can be found more easily in prose romances, short narrative *cantari*, and Renaissance reprises than in long verse romances, a topic discussed at length in this volume's next three essays. Stefano Mula looks at the ways in which Italian prose *romanciers* established narrative threads that were both inter-textual and adaptive. Maria Bendinelli Predelli discusses the Arthurian material in Italian *cantari*, a genre of anonymous stand-alone non-cyclical narratives, dating from the second half of the fourteenth century, which, strikingly, were not directly adapted from any known French sources. Since the lines marking the transition in Italy from the late medieval to the early Renaissance are often blurred, Eleonora Stoppino concludes the second section of this volume with a study that focuses on geographical centres that helped to diffuse and circulate texts both Carolingian and Arthurian.

The essays in the third part look at Italian Arthuriana beyond the generic limitations of the romance. Roberta Capelli provides a survey of Arthurian allusions in Italian lyric poems from the thirteenth to the fifteenth centuries. F. Regina Ptaki examines Italian prose from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries that borrows Arthurian materials to serve any number of narrative purposes. Christopher Kleinhenz concludes with an exploration of the relationship among Dante, Petrarch, and Boccaccio and Arthurian materials, which were present for each writer as a kind of cultural given whose 'reception ... ranges from an ambivalent appraisal of their moral virtues (Dante) and an almost casual dismissal of their worthiness (Petrarch) to a generally warm embrace of them and their fabulous stories (Boccaccio)' (p. 159).

But the Arthurian presence in Italy is as much extra-literary as it is literary. Franco Cardini looks at the legend of St Galganus, replete with its own sword in the stone. Gloria Allaire first examines evidence concerning owners and readers of Arthurian material to map the ways in which the Arthuriad criss-crossed the Italian peninsula for several centuries and then concludes the volume with a survey of the visual Italian Arthuriad to be found in frescoes and mosaics, sculptures, and decorative objects. Long overdue and not easily replicated, Allaire and Ptaki's collection will doubtless be the standard study of the Italian Arthuriad for years to come.

KEVIN J. HARTY, *La Salle University*

**Barnet**, Peter, Michael **Brandt**, and Gerhard **Lutz**, eds, *Medieval Treasures from Hildesheim*, New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2013; paperback; pp. x, 138; 110 colour illustrations; R.R.P. US\$24.95; ISBN 9780300196993.

I was not able to see this splendid-looking exhibition of the medieval treasures from Hildesheim when they were displayed at The Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York between 17 September 2013 and 5 January 2014. The repair of the cathedral in celebration of the 1200th anniversary of the foundation of Hildesheim as a bishopric enabled the Museum to borrow the cathedral treasures, which had to be moved during the works. It was the good fortune and good planning of those involved from the two institutions that so many treasures were able to be displayed.

The origins of this exhibition lie with Charlemagne, who subdued the pagan Saxons in the late ninth century. Charlemagne's son, Louis the Pious (778–840), founded the bishopric of Hildesheim in Lower Saxony in 815 and installed the first bishop, Gunthar (reigned 815–34). Hildesheim's fourth bishop, Alfried (reigned 847–74), built the first cathedral. Three bishops of Hildesheim – Bernward (thirteenth bishop, reigned 993–1022), Godehard (reigned 1022–38), and Bernhard (reigned 1130–53) – were the original patrons of most of the items on display in the exhibition. After Godehard

and Bernward were canonised in the twelfth century, Hildesheim became a pilgrimage destination.

*Medieval Treasures* contains only two chapters. The first, 'Hildesheim: Centre of Medieval Art', places the exhibition in its geographical and historical context. Twenty-one figures illustrate the text. They include buildings (St Mary's Cathedral, St Michael's Church, and St Godehard's Church), a portrait of Bishop Bernward in the Precious Gospels, and a 1650 drawing of St Michael's Church. Two monumental works cast in bronze from Hildesheim were omitted from the exhibition because of their size and weight. The first of these, Bishop Bernward's doors (figs 12–14), illustrates biblical scenes. Completed about 1015, the doors stand more than fifteen feet high. (They were detached and on display in the museum when I visited Hildesheim in 2009.) The second is Bernward's column, more than twelve feet high, which depicts twenty-four episodes from the life of Christ.

The second, much longer, chapter, 'Works from Medieval Hildesheim', presents forty-eight illustrated objects, ranging in date from the last third of the ninth century (Small Bernward Gospel, cat. 1) to c. 1400 (Burial Cross, cat. 48), arranged in rough chronological order. From the beginning, the Hildesheim bishops accumulated treasures that eventually encompassed intricate works of ivory, enamel, bronze, gold, and wood, having southern Italian or German origins. From these materials and others, a cornucopia of religious objects were fashioned. The items on display included reliquaries, ivory and silver crosiers, the seal of the Cathedral Chapter, and elaborate chalices and patens. Illustrated are leaves from the Bernward Bible, the only complete bible to have survived from the tenth and early eleventh centuries (cat. 5). Particularly fine are three liturgical fans, made from gilded copper and decorated with translucent rock crystal and thought to be used to fan the altar, either symbolically or in reality (cats 17, 18, and 19). One side of the Crosier of Abbot Ekanbald illustrates the catalogue front jacket and the other is at cat. 12. Although the doors and the column were too large to bring, the bronze baptismal font (cat. 38), 95.9 centimetres in diameter, with its image of John the Baptist baptising Christ and other biblical scenes that prefigured or are associated with baptism, was on display. Five crucifixions (cats 8, 10, 23, 24, and 36) show the wide range of artistic skills that could be brought to bear on this one image. The Ringelheim crucifix (cat. 8) contains two stones in a leather pouch and two bone relics: the stones have been documented as originating at the Holy Sepulchre at Jerusalem and the bones from saints Cosmos and Damian.

Although the exhibition took place in New York, it complements other historical exhibitions held in Germany to commemorate its medieval past with displays of treasures made with veneration and skill. A recent example

is *Karl der Grosse* at Aachen in 2014 to commemorate 1,200 years since Charlemagne's death.

I have one minor quibble: it is unfortunate that the deep three-dimensionality of the cast figures in Bishop Bernward's doors are not brought out more clearly in the photographs, which are all taken from the front. That said, the catalogue, printed in Italy, is a high quality production. The text is well informed, written in a clear style, with a detailed index and bibliography and enables the reader to place the exhibits in context.

*Medieval Treasures* is highly recommended for those interested in cathedral treasures placed in context by a well-illustrated, scholarly text.

PENELOPE NASH, *The University of Sydney*

**Bayman, Anna**, *Thomas Dekker and the Culture of Pamphleteering in Early Modern London*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 168; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9780754661733.

Thomas Dekker (d. 1632) presents a number of different aspects and achievements to later readers and interpreters: as a playwright of sole-authored plays (most famously, *The Shoemaker's Holiday*), of collaborative plays (including *The Witch of Edmonton*), but also as a prolific hack writer. Anna Bayman's study is of Dekker as a prolific writer but as more than a hack, and as an author whose pamphlets contributed to public and intellectual discourse. Dekker authored a number of pamphlets, chief among them *The Seven Deadly Sins of London* (1606), about urban life in the English capital. It is on these pamphlets and their portrayal and commentary on London and its rogues and underworld that Bayman focuses. These too present great variety. Particular study is made of the so-called 'cony-catching' pamphlets, or those which recount the antics of London criminals. Equally multi-faceted was Dekker's own experience of London. Bayman also revisits the usual evidence for suggesting Dekker was London-born, and also considers his contrasting periods of success (including working with the Lord Chamberlain's Men) and failures (such as a lengthy period of imprisonment in King's Bench). Situating what Dekker said against what happened to him and when he was writing is one aspect of this study.

Bayman suggests that, unlike pamphlets by Robert Greene, which reported and described rogues' actions in the authorial voice of a concerned magistrate or citizen, Dekker's pamphlets about rogues were more 'ambivalent' (p. 110). She points to technical and grammatical specifics of Dekker's writing, such as shifts from the third to the first person, or the introduction of dialogue, aspects that cumulatively blurred the authorial voice and therefore the stance that the pamphlets took on the rogues. Bayman goes further, locating in the authorial ambiguities the fact that the underworld

being described was largely fictitious, created to sell pamphlets, and that the pamphlets themselves cheated their readers.

Nonetheless, Bayman identifies in Dekker's writings some historically plausible aspects of the descriptions of rogues and gangs. Her interpretation follows contours laid out by earlier scholars including Griffith and Shaw, with Shaw in particular having seen Dekker's hand in a large proportion of the prison literature written in the Jacobean period. Pursuing these points, Bayman argues for Dekker developing the conventions of crime literature due to the emphasis he placed in his works on the implications of crime, namely the threat of prison and the gallows.

Besides the rogues and gulls (liberal, cheating characters), Bayman considers other themes suggested by evidence in the pamphlets, leading her, for instance, to a fresh interpretation of Dekker's religion, as. Bayman departs from earlier interpretations that suggested Dekker's faith might be reconstructed as Calvinist, pointing out that selective quotation of disparate references about being chosen or predestined can be misleading. She instead points to the rarity of direct comments or doctrinal positions in any of Dekker's pamphlets. In works such as *Dekker his Dreame* of 1620, Bayman even finds 'thorny' doctrinal points, ideas she suggests were provocative at the time in the wake of the Synod of Dort and the emerging and publicly discussed disagreements in English theology.

As is clear from such observations, Bayman interprets Dekker's pamphlets (and his plays as well) as responsive to their immediate context. She further suggests that the aftermath of the 1605 Gunpowder Plot drew from Dekker a more 'bellicose' anti-Catholic set of sentiments and observations than had been previously apparent in his writings. At a deeper level, she positions Dekker the pamphleteer as a writer responsive to trends and tropes of his own time, locating him as part of a circle that also included Ben Jonson and whose members were appreciative of the rhetoric about peace that was part of James I's reign, rather than the chivalric and militaristic tone of nostalgia that characterised Elizabeth's. The culture of pamphleteering in which she shows Dekker as participating was one she suggests was attuned to the peaceful rhetoric of James's reign and it is as a writer embedded in the Jacobean period that Bayman surveys his output.

MARCUS HARMES, *The University of Southern Queensland*

**Beer**, Jeanette, *In Their Own Words: Practices of Quotation in Early Medieval History-Writing*, Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 176; R.R.P. US\$50.00; ISBN 9781442647541.

Given current interest in the crusades and chronicles, this book will have a wide readership. Jeanette Beer has here pursued her scholarly work in the field of medieval history-writing through the formative period between

the ninth and the thirteenth centuries, from the Strasbourg oaths to the compilation/translation of *Li Fet des Romains*. She sets out from Isidore of Seville's definition of history as the narration of events that deserve to be remembered and which constitute the truth. Hence the importance of eyewitness accounts, *ipsissima verba* ('words actually spoken') and the use of direct and indirect speech in this examination of five landmark texts, three of which are chronicles by Crusade participants.

The Strasbourg oaths in Nithard's *Historiae* contain the earliest words of French recorded. Building on her analysis in an earlier essay, Beer explains the chancery process and the function of the oaths in the *Historiae*, where they are preceded by a speech in Latin. She speculates on the understanding of the vernacular by the respective French- and German-speaking armies and on what they reflect of Nithard's anxiety for the empire.

The anonymous *Gesta Francorum et aliorum Hierosolimitanorum*, a straightforward narrative in Latin, is an eyewitness account of the First Crusade from a soldier's viewpoint. It has been recognised as the expedition's unofficial history. The author believed that events in which he participated were of epic importance and frequently used direct speech to endorse the veracity and immediacy of his story. He presented, for example, the pope's call to the Crusade as though he had been present and heard the very words.

Villehardouin, a leader and negotiator in the Fourth Crusade, presented in *La Conquête de Constantinople* a different viewpoint and experience for an audience interested in diplomacy as well as military activity. He referred to himself and his participation in the third person, speaking also as author and eyewitness in the first person, and sometimes shifting responsibility somewhat ambiguously to *li livres*, 'the book'. His use of direct speech is concentrated in the first half of the chronicle, for example, in the account of negotiations with the doge of Venice and the pope.

In contrast, Robert de Clari's account of the Fourth Crusade is that of a poor knight following his overlord and returning home before the eventual *débâcle*. His lively narrative of 'le dreite verité' (p. 58), everything he could remember, as he likes to repeat, using the first person as self-referencing and direct speech, sometimes for dramatic effect, verges on the fabliau style, it is suggested, for he is pre-eminently a storyteller.

Two chapters are devoted to *Li Fet des Romains*, which Beer studied in *A Medieval Caesar* (Droz, 1976). It is an anonymous compilation translated into the French vernacular from all the known works concerning Julius Caesar, first and foremost from his Commentaries on the Gallic wars and Lucan's *Bellum Civile*, with debts and attributions to other classical historians. Interesting points discussed include: Caesar's dictum, the compiler's tactical shifting of responsibility when he disagreed with his source material, adaptation of Lucan's verse epic and its pagan mythology, supplementation,



and interpolation. The compiler/translator astutely employed quotation, sometimes appropriating it, at other times distancing himself from ancient historians and speaking in his own voice to complete the truth.

Analysis of the stylistic practice of quotation and self-referencing shows how the five specimen texts significantly contributed to the evolution of medieval history-writing. An Afterword sketches their diffusion and later role as sources, in turn, for quotation.

Notes, Works Cited, a Name Index, and a Subject Index complete the work. All French and Latin passages cited are carefully translated into English. Oversights are rare, but in two instances a word was inadvertently repeated: 'are' (p. 33, translation l.1), 'abundantly' (p. 80). A poem by Conon de Béthune is quoted (pp. 72–73), but the edition does not appear in the Notes or Works Cited. This is, however, a well-produced book, with a jacket illustration of the Crusader assault on Jerusalem (1099) from a fourteenth-century manuscript.

In these essays, Beer has returned to texts she knows intimately, and has revealed new perspectives and relationships, which complement the present state of understanding of the techniques and purposes of medieval French history-writing.

GLYNNIS M. CROPP, *Massey University*

**Bell, David N.**, *The Library of the Abbey of La Trappe: A Study of its History from the Twelfth Century to the French Revolution, with an Annotated Edition of the 1752 Catalogue* (Medieval Church Studies, 32), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xiv, 648; 3 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €125.00; ISBN 9782503545714.

Medievalists will be familiar with David N. Bell's formidable publications in the area of medieval manuscript and Cistercian studies. His latest book, which includes a study of the library of the Cistercian abbey of La Trappe and the role in its development of its great reforming abbot, Armand-Jean de Rancé, moves into the terrain of post-medieval French monastic history. Three-quarters of this volume, however, consist of an annotated edition of the monastery's 1752 library catalogue, arranged 'par ordres de matières' and 'par ordre alphabétique' according to best practice at the time, in which Bell identifies specific editions where possible and valiantly provides brief biographical notices on the authors, some of whom are extremely obscure.

The edition is introduced by six chapters that cover the history of the library and its contents. The book's sub-title dates La Trappe's library to the twelfth century: the monastery was founded in Normandy in 1140, flourished until falling victim to the Hundred Years' War in 1337, and was pillaged several times during the next century. But there is little to say about the library's early history: Bell has so far identified thirty-four of its medieval

manuscripts and the 1752 Catalogue lists only four incunables and a handful of post-incunables.

In the sixteenth century, La Trappe became subject to the commendatory system: the French king regularly appointed non-resident prelates to the abbacy, specifically in 1636 Armand-Jean de Rancé, aged only 11. Carefully educated, the child came from a wealthy family that regarded La Trappe (among other monasteries) as a family cash-cow. But after the death of his mistress in 1657, de Rancé repudiated his worldly life and eventually decided to take his abbatial role seriously, becoming La Trappe's regular abbot in 1664. After a difficult and controversial life devoted to reform, he died in 1700.

It was de Rancé's personal collection, mainly of contemporary theology, that provided the nucleus (maybe one-third) of the monastic library. By the mid-eighteenth century the library contained about 4,300 volumes (or between 1940 and 1990 titles), comparable in size to libraries of other Cistercian houses though, we are told, small compared to some Benedictine ones. Of these items, 65 per cent were seventeenth-century publications and 83 per cent were religious or devotional (Bell argues that this is an unusually high proportion). There were also histories, classical texts, and works on the arts, sciences, and language, in spite of Trappist discouragement of secular learning: de Rancé and his successors severely restricted access to the library and to the types of books the monks could read. Between 1752 and 1790 another thousand volumes, mainly works of popular piety and devotion, were added. In 1792 the monastery was suppressed, the library was inventoried and sealed (about a thousand books had already vanished, perhaps to Switzerland with some of the monks) and most of its contents auctioned off.

In his final chapter, Bell addresses the library's 'Cistercian dimension'. The collection was short on medieval Cistercian writers, apart from St Bernard himself; later Cistercian writings, many of them little known, are mainly historical or documentary. Cistercians of all stripes (Common Observance, Trappists, Abstinents, Feuillants) contributed less than 10 per cent of the collection.

This is an immensely detailed study on a somewhat *recherché* topic. It contains much valuable information for those interested in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century religious and book culture, although they may have to dig hard for it. The combination of a diachronic institutional history with a synchronic analysis of the 1752 Catalogue can be confusing and sometimes results in repetition or apparent contradiction. The publishers also point out the book's relevance for those interested in the development of library cataloguing: not at first sight an appealing topic, but without it, where would we all be?

ALEXANDRA BARRATT, *The University of Waikato*

**Black, Jeremy**, *Politics and Foreign Policy in the Age of George I, 1714–1727*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 298; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409431398.

*Politics and Foreign Policy in the Age of George I, 1714–1727* is a robust analysis of the challenges faced by Britain during George I's reign. Jeremy Black's work here adds to his considerable breadth of research in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century England, providing a thorough examination of the relationship between foreign and domestic politics under the reign of George I.

Audiences seeking to develop their understanding of this area, noted as being somewhat neglected in recent decades, will benefit from Black's analysis. He prefaces the book by acknowledging the contributions from other researchers of the period, such as Graham Gibbs, Edward Gregg, and Clyde Jones. Furthermore, Black positions his work within the arena of existing research and identifies himself as a participant in ongoing commentary and discussions in the field of history and politics right up until the present, also noting parallels and issues that are reflected within foreign policy today.

The links Black draws provide a major contribution to the field that will be of particular benefit and interest for readers seeking to understand the ramifications of George I's policies during the early modern period, as well as the period in focus for the book itself. Black discusses the events in British history that influenced foreign and domestic relations under George I's rule, including the Glorious Revolution and the Restoration, in addition to more contemporary influences, such as the Jacobite Rebellion. Discussions surrounding Whig and Tory relations of the time and their influence on the monarchy, along with the monarchy's influence on the parties themselves, will also be of interest to readers seeking to further their knowledge of this area of politics and history.

Black's work makes a major contribution to his field in the breadth of source documents he has consulted: his extensive research has taken him to numerous foreign archives, including Hanover, Munich, Paris, and Vienna. The wide range of sources has resulted in a balanced analysis of both foreign and domestic politics and policy that provides perspectives from multiple countries and governments. This enables the reader to develop a deeper understanding of the issues raised by Black, accompanied by insights that emphasise the importance for historians of taking account of a variety, in this case, foreign, viewpoints when analysing historical events.

Black's clearly organised chapters follow the major events of George I's politics and policy during his reign. The first two chapters are dedicated to the kingdom George inherited from Queen Anne, and more significantly, the impact of the Tory and Whig parliamentary imbalance that existed as George came to power. As the study progresses, Black adjusts his focus between

George I and the events that impacted upon his reign and political and foreign policy decisions, and the wider consequences of both in the historical progression of British politics and diplomacy.

Black's successful examination of George I, politics, and foreign policy between 1714 and 1727, will appeal to scholars of George I as the work focuses not on the monarch, but on his policies. Additionally, Black's work provides a vital contribution to scholarship regarding the evolution of England and British policy during the eighteenth century.

TROY HEFFERNAN, *The University of Southern Queensland*

**Boulton**, Maureen B. M., *Piety and Persecution in the French Texts of England* (Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 420; French of England Translation Series, 6), Tempe, ACMRS, 2013; hardback; pp. xii, 220; R.R.P. US\$64.00; ISBN 9780866984683.

The French of England Translation Series is now well established as an introduction for students of medieval studies (and sometimes, no doubt, their teachers) to the enormous range of French texts written in England from the twelfth to the fifteenth centuries. This latest volume, translated by the co-editor of *Anglo-Norman Literature: A Guide to Texts and Manuscripts* (Anglo-Norman Text Society, 1999), draws on the numerous religious texts which make up the bulk (well more than half, we are told) of Anglo-Norman writing. It can be seen as complementary to Tony Hunt's '*Chere alme*': *Texts of Anglo-Norman Piety* (ACMRS, 2010), which was an Occasional Publication (the only one so far) in the same series.

The texts cover the entire spectrum of Anglo-Norman religious writing: theological exposition, biblical and quasi-biblical narrative, hagiography, prayers, and other devotional writings. All the texts represented here are centred on the person of Christ but are otherwise very varied, and Maureen Boulton is at pains to stress the contrast between the theological sophistication of Grosseteste's *Castle of Love* and the popularism of, for instance, *The Childhood of Jesus Christ* or *Little Saint Hugh of Lincoln*. Most of these texts will also have a specific interest for students of Middle English literature, as they are closely related to various texts in English. Robert Grosseteste's poem possibly influenced *Piers Plowman*; *The Childhood of Jesus Christ* may be the source of a poem found in the oldest copy of the *South English Legendary*; *The Vengeance of Our Lord* is an account of the destruction of Jerusalem, a theme treated in three Middle English poems; the story of Little St Hugh of Lincoln, which obviously parallels Chaucer's *Prioress's Tale*, was an abiding and not altogether benevolent presence in English folk-memory; and one of various prayers and meditations on the Passion Boulton translates was a source for the fifteenth-century translator Dame Eleanor Hull's *Meditations on the Days of the Week*. Another theme that gives the collection coherence is the presence in many

of the texts of strongly anti-Jewish polemic (the 'Persecution' of the title), which supports Boulton's contention that such an animus was ubiquitous in much medieval writing in both English and French.

The Introduction is far more thorough than one would expect for an anthology of translations. It considers each text in turn and includes discussions of manuscript witnesses, sources, style, and later influence. Then the texts are presented, in translation, with extensive scholarly apparatus. Unlike *'Chere alme': Texts of Anglo-Norman Piety*, there are no facing-page French texts. Appendix 1, however, contains the hitherto unedited Anglo-Norman originals of five of the more substantial Passion texts, and Appendix 2 some representative extracts from each of the other texts, all of which have been previously published (though not necessarily readily available). This makes for a considerably shorter book than Hunt's: 219 as opposed to 445 pages. Like all the books in the series, it is beautifully produced; the front cover reproduces a miniature of the Child Jesus, whose presentation in *The Childhood of Jesus Christ* gives new meaning to the term 'holy terror', sliding down a sunbeam. By not printing more of the originals, the series perhaps misses a rare opportunity to introduce students to the Anglo-Norman language itself.

ALEXANDRA BARRATT, *The University of Waikato*

**Callisen**, Christian Thorsten, ed., *Reading and Writing History from Bruni to Windschuttle: Essays in Honour of Gary Ianziti*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 272; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409457053.

This is a most valuable book and should be on the shelves of all persons interested in western historiographical efforts. Gary Ianziti is certainly a great figure in the reassessment of Renaissance historiography, and other matters too, and especially so in the Anglophone world. The editor and John Gagné (of the University of Sydney) provide an excellent introduction to the career and writings of Ianziti and well summarise the diverse contributions within the present volume and what unites them. I have myself experienced the scholarship and friendship of Ianziti, having had many fruitful discussions with him concerning the origins of modern historiographical patterns (on which now see the challenging observations of Walter Kudrycz, in his *The Historical Present, Medievalism and Modernity*, 2011). As Callisen stresses, what distinguishes Ianziti's approach is his link-up between an individual's historiography and the local pressures, constraints, and contexts, which produced both innovation and compliance with the major political objectives of the ruling groups of the time.

The essays in the present volume are diverse, and cover Quattrocento translations and ideas about the same, moving from translating Greek into Latin, and into the vernacular, with evaluative comments including: Bruni's

own views and translations (Andrea Rizzi); a wide-ranging expansion of Cochrane's historiographical categories for history-writing generally in the Renaissance, and in particular in Milan after the French occupation of 1499, concluding that 'the political discourse over history had diversified ... to permit propaganda and history to meet in new and unexpected venues in a variety of media' (John Gagné, p. 55); a further broadening consideration of historiography in Milan 1400–1540, covering in particular Guicciardini (Jane Black); an examination of Bruni's constitutional ideas, concluding 'Only a popular regime like the Florentine one can guarantee the kind of freedom that emerges when no citizen has a superior he must fear and obey; when there is a government of laws and not of men' (James Hankins, p. 86); an examination of Machiavelli and humanist historiography showing how Machiavelli used prevailing humanist historiographical methodology to pervert the life of Castruccio Castracani and to construct his *Istorie Fiorentine* (contrasts with *Il Principe* and the *Discorsi* are pointed out; Robert Black). Callisen himself has contributed a chapter on Georg Calixtus's views on the study of history (Calixtus was Pro-Rector of the University of Helmstedt in Brunswick, and a professor of Theology, 1586–1656). Ian Hunter has a chapter on the uses of natural law in early modern Germany (concentrating on Christian Thomasius (1655–1728), who suffered much criticism from his home University of Leipzig). Chris Hanlon has a chapter on medieval sacred biography, while Catherine Dewhirst seems the furthest from Ianziti and Bruni with her examination of a particular letter collection produced by Italian migration to Australia in the years 1900–15. Sue Keays maintains the distance from Bruni and Ianziti by examining in close and fascinating detail the relationship between fact and fiction in the ancient accounts of the Emperor Claudius, and in Robert Graves's epic novels on the subject. John M. Headley's final chapter is quite remarkable, and again, far from Bruni and Ianziti. He sees western civilisation marked by, and to be congratulated for, its long-term search for global universality of community and equal opportunity, excluding no-one. In the current climate of tension between the West and the Muslim world this contribution is very well worth reading, however much the particularism of Islamic fundamentalism rejects its thesis. I warm to Headley as he considers the twelfth century 'the most creative and constructive century in the entire Western development' (p. 209, a view much supported by R. I. Moore in his *The First European Revolution c. 970–1215* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2000)). Headley assigns an intriguing role in the construction of the western global community to the Jesuits and stresses the role played by Cicero himself, in his *De officiis*.

A well-edited and highly stimulating work on historiography in the West, this volume forms a moving tribute to the life and works of Gary Ianziti.

There is a general bibliography and an index, together with a bibliography of Ianziti's own writings.

JOHN O. WARD, *The University of Sydney*

**Cavallo, Jo Ann**, *The World beyond Europe in the Romance Epics of Boiardo and Ariosto* (Toronto Italian Studies), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2013; cloth; pp. 392; R.R.P. US\$85.00; ISBN 9781442646834.

In this compelling book, Jo Ann Cavallo shows that the two most influential chivalric poems from late fifteenth- and early sixteenth-century Italy are in fact a world apart. Lodovico Ariosto's *Orlando Furioso* ('Raging Roland') was first published in 1516 as a continuation of the narrative in Matteo Maria Boiardo's 1495 *Orlando Innamorato* ('Orlando in Love'). Two decades might not seem much – especially from our distant vantage point – yet, this span of time radically changed the literary and geopolitical perception of Europe and the East. Cavallo describes vividly the contrast between the joyful, open-minded, and utopic world of chivalry in Boiardo's poem and Ariosto's return to the conflict between Christians and Saracens underpinning the Carolingian epic. Cavallo does so by offering a thoroughly researched examination of the literary sources that shaped Boiardo's narrative and Ariosto's reinterpretation of the material.

From the outset, Cavallo explains that the court of Ferrara, for which the two poems were written, was a significant centre for the production and consumption of maps, histories, and accounts of pilgrimages to the East. Several sources on the Crusades and the East were readily accessible to the Ferrarese court, as Boiardo's *Historia Imperiale* (c. 1473) demonstrates: from the Greek histories by Herodotus and Xenophon to Giovanni da Pian del Carpine's *Historia Mongalorum* (c. 1245), John Mandeville's *Travels*, and Hayton of Corycus's *The Flower of Histories of the East*. The lords of Ferrara were also keen collectors of oriental carpets, Arabian horses, and treatises on astrology. Chivalric poems and *cantari* offered, therefore, a rich platform on which the connections and frictions between the East and the West played out.

Cavallo's book is a tribute to Boiardo's 'global interpenetration under the banner of a universal chivalric code' (p. 260) and his insatiable curiosity about African, Asian, and Middle Eastern landscapes and traditions. Ariosto did not share the same positive worldview. His reinterpretation of the *Orlando Innamorato* is an outright rejection of Boiardo's chivalric cosmopolitanism. As Cavallo explains in the final section of her work, the wars and invasions that plagued Italy at the turn of the sixteenth century left a mark on Ariosto. Admittedly, they had also made Boiardo abandon his own poem at the beginning of Book III. Ariosto's changed perception of the universality of chivalry drove the hero Rinaldo to the Po valley, where dangers were then greater than any remote African or Asian city. Understandably, Cavallo



indulges on Boiardo's 'multiculturalism' and leaves less room for Ariosto's more religious and moralising view of the 'other'.

This volume skilfully takes the reader through Boiardo's key non-European characters and their journeys across Asia, Africa, the Middle East, and the Italian Po valley: Cavallo sheds light on Boiardo's syncretic use of sources to narrate the adventures of African king Agramante, his cousin Rugiero, and Rodamonte. Boiardo's poem was not impermeable to current affairs. As Cavallo argues, the threat posed by Agramante's invasion of Europe mirrored the Ottomans' forays into Southern Italy in the 1480s. These shadows became greater and more menacing in Ariosto's poem, as the last two sections of the book demonstrate: the adventurous, chivalrous, and open minded Frankish knight described in the *Orlando Innamorato* became a staunch and narrow-minded defender of Christianity against the 'other'.

The book's most insightful case-study is the analysis of the treatment of the Saracen knight Brandimarte in the two poems: in Boiardo's text this knight is an unfaltering champion of universal knighthood, whereas in Ariosto's he is rewritten as a minor character, condemned by his non-Christian identity.

Cavallo's work follows in the footsteps of Pio Rajna and Neil Harris and their ground-breaking research on the literary richness and vitality of Boiardo's poem. Given the imbalance in the space devoted to Boiardo's text as opposed to Ariosto's *Furioso*, Cavallo's book is somewhat biased towards the *Orlando Innamorato*. But this is counterbalanced by the merit in offering a compelling interpretation of the metamorphosis of chivalric literature at the turn of the sixteenth century, as it evolved from a highly localised literature upholding universal values (Boiardo) to a universal poem underscoring highly localised values (Ariosto).

This incredibly rich and rigorous study of Boiardo's literary world invites further research on the readership, transmission, and reception of these poems. It urges scholars and readers not to treat these two important poems as two distinct phases in the cultural history of the Renaissance, but as a difficult transition from the utopian chivalric codes nurtured by an idealised and local court to a 'global' literature exposing the chronotopic tension between current affairs and epos.

ANDREA RIZZI, *The University of Melbourne*

**Cooper**, Lisa H., and **Andrea Denny-Brown**, eds, *The Arma Christi in Medieval and Early Modern Material Culture. With a Critical Edition of 'O Vernicle'*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 448; 29 colour, 29 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £85.00; ISBN 9781409456766.

While the instruments of Christ's Passion have been a familiar motif in Christian art since late antiquity, the presentation of these objects in isolation seems to have developed in the late medieval period. Images of these objects



appear in a variety of contexts and media, including ivory tablets, tombs, paintings, and manuscripts. The mid-fourteenth-century *Arma Christi* from James le Palmer's *Omne Bonum*, reproduced on the cover of this collection, gives an encyclopaedic sequence of thirty-eight images, including the crucifixion and the Man of Sorrows motif. It also shows a cock, thirty pieces of silver, scourges, and other images that might otherwise defy explanation, such as the wound from Christ's side, a pelican plucking blood from her breast to feed her offspring, and the Mocking of Christ, represented by a single figure spitting on a haloed Christ figure. These images are, however, part of a much richer complex of writings and devotional practices, that can be further fleshed out by examining not only the history of the individual objects but also shifts in their cultural meanings. It is also useful to remember that at the time of the creation of these works, the objects themselves were believed still to exist, preserved as precious relics.

This collection contains ten essays that look at this theme from a variety of different periods, beginning with late antiquity and the early Middle Ages, focusing mainly on the late medieval period, but also including its post-Reformation history. While most of the studies look to England, there is one essay on Ireland, and two continental discussions looking at works by Michelangelo and Hieronymous Bosch (though these latter two sit somewhat uneasily within the general frame of the collection, which is not to criticise Suzanne Verderber's skilled discussion of Bosch's difficult iconography). In addition, the final section consists of a critical edition of the Middle English poem 'O Vernicle' edited by Ann Eljenhom Nichols, highlighting too the importance of the theme to literary scholars. It is a pity that the focus on British evidence has meant that the important European Early Modern context has been left out, making the references to Bosch and Michelangelo, in particular, seem exceptional.

One of the real strengths of this collection is the variety of different angles and approaches taken by each of the contributors. As an art historian, I was particularly taken by the discussions of the early fifteenth-century *Arma Christi* rolls and the use of the idea of the virtual pilgrimage. The interaction between private devotional practices, texts, and images was particularly fascinating, giving a convincing account of the practicalities of using the roll-format, which an older tradition saw as a form of public display. Both Richard Newhauser and Arthur Russell's and Nichols's essays are models of careful and nuanced scholarship. I was also impressed by Mary Agnes Edsall's discussion of early Christian and medieval representations of the instruments of the Passion, bringing in not only the Utrecht Psalter, but also early Christian sermons and other writings on the Passion. The use of rhetorical devices like *ekphrasis* by figures such as Chromatius, who created vivid memory images of place and object was, for me, thought provoking. As the editors, Lisa

Cooper and Andrea Denny-Brown, point out in their Introduction, there is a real shift over time from the use of these instruments as trophies and symbols of triumph to their transformation into representations of suffering in later images.

The collection traces the shifts in devotional practices in the later medieval period through this single theme. It is also an excellent example of the role an interest in material culture can play in opening up new questions for scholars in the range of disciplines represented in this anthology.

JUDITH COLLARD, *The University of Otago*

**Danielson**, Sigrid, and Evan A. **Gatti**, eds, *Envisioning the Bishop: Images and the Episcopacy in the Middle Ages* (Medieval Church Studies, 29), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xx, 452; 7 colour, 45 b/w illustrations, 2 b/w line art; R.R.P. €110.00; ISBN 9782503547992.

Studies of the secular clergy have for too long taken a back seat to those of the regulars but a society devoted to their cause is now starting to redress the balance. This book is the second collection published as a result of panels convened at various conferences by EPISCOPUS, a very approximate name for the Society for the Study of Bishops and the Secular Clergy in the Middle Ages. The earlier collection, *The Bishop Reformed* (Ashgate, 2007), was reviewed in *Parergon*, 27.1 (2010).

The present, substantial volume comprises seventeen essays prefaced by the customary historiographical and theoretical introduction. The latter relies heavily on the work of the German art historian, Hans Belting, who ‘remind[s] us that images are never isolated. They must be both invented and perceived creating complex and recurring processes around their production, dissemination, affects and aftereffects’ (p. 1), sentiments with which, apart perhaps from the idea of recurrence, few historians would be inclined to quarrel. An Afterword by Maureen C. Miller indicates some of the common themes that emerge from the collection and concludes that ‘Medieval bishops have a great deal to tell us about concerns that are quite contemporary’, citing for example ‘how virtue came to be associated with sober attire rather than splendid silks’ (p. 434).

Although the editors are art historians and the volume boasts both coloured and black and white illustrations, the studies are not confined to visual images of episcopacy. Indeed, roughly half of the essays are concerned with images/ideals/conceptions of the bishop derived from non-visual sources, including Sita Steckel’s on Carolingian book dedications and Sherry Reames’s on rewriting the various *vitae* of St Wulfstan of Worcester. A more unusual source for episcopal norms – mnemonic verses in canon law texts – is explored by Winston Black. This is an example of an essay which sticks to a single genre of writing. Even more narrowly focused is that of Alice Chapman

who investigates the image of the bishop found in Bernard of Clairvaux's *De Consideratione*.

Others employ various degrees of intertextuality though lack of space means not all can be mentioned. Thus, Kalani Craig describes Gregory of Tours's use of imagery from the Vulgate with reference to episcopal authority in the *Histories*. A number of essays combine visual and non-visual sources: Deborah M. Deliyannis maps the frequency of donor portraits of bishops in Roman churches against different redactions of the *Liber Pontificalis* from the sixth to the ninth centuries. Joanne M. Pierce suggests how the images of Sigebert of Minden, appearing in the liturgical books made for his personal use, interact with the written text. Kara Ann Morrow's essay on the sculptured portals of Bourges Cathedral is particularly adept at combining visual imagery (sculpture, manuscript illustrations, architectural features) with biblical texts, saints' lives, and writings, both liturgical and expository, relating them among other things to sacred architecture and the consecration of churches.

Information on the back cover promises 'material from Late Antiquity through the thirteenth century' and indeed the essays are arranged chronologically rather than thematically, each century being represented at least once. An unexpected bonus beyond the stated chronological range is William J. Diebold's fascinating essay on exhibitions featuring Ottonian bishops in modern Germany and their relationship to changes in political and cultural sensibilities. The geographical spread is less even, being largely concentrated on Rome and modern France, Germany, England, and Ireland.

The volume is well produced with footnotes rather than endnotes and individual bibliographies attached to each essay. The coloured plates are grouped together at the front of the book, while the black and white illustrations are generally placed in proximity to the relevant text. However, there is a major problem on p. 162 in Dorothy Hoogland Verkerk's essay on pastoral imagery in Early Ireland. The discussion here refers to Figure 7.4 captioned "'Crucifixion", Cross of Durrow', but the reader will look in vain for the features mentioned, such as raised arms and large hands. In fact, it seems that Fig. 7.4 shows not the crucifixion at all but the second coming which is on the opposite face of the cross of Durrow to the depiction of the crucifixion. Hopefully, this can be remedied at a later printing, allowing the book to claim its place as an important work in the expanding field of studies devoted to bishops and the secular clergy.

SABINA FLANAGAN, *The University of Adelaide*

**Denery**, Dallas G., II, **Kantik Ghosh**, and Nicolette **Zeeman**, eds, *Uncertain Knowledge: Scepticism, Relativism, and Doubt in the Middle Ages* (Disputatio, 14), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. viii, 345; 10 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503547763.

This book originated in a research project and workshop examining uncertain knowledge in the Middle Ages. The papers fall broadly into two camps, philosophical and literary. The editors' Introduction makes clear that this breadth arises from an explicit strategy aimed at exploring both the role played by scepticism in the scholastic production of authorised knowledge and the subversion of that institutional knowledge by vernacular and lay cultural players. The focus is determinedly epistemological and largely ignores the vexed and voluminous subject of religious orthodoxy and heresy. Dallas G. Denery II opens the discussion with John of Salisbury's meditations on the attitude of the superior man in an environment, namely the court, rendered inherently deceptive by flattery and illusory pleasures. Denery sees in John a continuing humanist tradition masked by the ascendancy of scholasticism until its resurgence in the early modern era. Eileen C. Sweeney looks at the reception of Aristotle's *Posterior Analytics* by Grosseteste and Roger Bacon whose move to privilege scientific knowledge, and thereby implicitly problematise other forms, was resisted by the *Summa fratris Alexandri* and William of Auvergne's championing of faith as the only possible certainty.

Dominik Perler brings us to medieval considerations of the classical grounds of scepticism through Walter Chatton's and William Ockham's responses to Peter Aureol's attempt to account for sensory illusions by mediated perception. Perler concludes that radical scepticism was impossible within an Aristotelian framework committed to the reliability of our natural capacities. Christophe Grellard continues this theme with John Buridan's explanation of how it is possible to believe falsely. Buridan sympathetically employed the figure of the 'little old woman' to explain how habit, social pressure, and imagination might combine to distort perception and permit false belief. Concluding the more strictly philosophical section, Rita Copeland reveals the difficulty commentators, such as Giles of Rome, Buridan, and even the translator, William of Moerbeke, had in situating Aristotle's *Rhetoric* within the Ciceronian rhetorical tradition. Notwithstanding Aristotle's placing it under logic, the manuscript tradition preferred to group it with ethics and politics. Lesley Smith bridges the shift from the scholastic to the literary by looking at uncertainty in the study of the Bible. Medieval scholars were aware that they were dealing with fallible translations from unreliable texts and not all were content to resolve problems by allegorising. Nicholas of Lyra turned to a rabbi for the cultural background of the Bible. William of Auvergne and Richard and Hugh of St Victor sought rational explanations of biblical stories while accepting that uncertainty would persist.

Karen Sullivan shifts the focus to vernacular literature with Robert de Boron's *Merlin*. Rejecting a rationalist denunciation of Merlin as diabolically inspired, Boron draws on a contemplative perspective that employs the prophet's mysterious nature to valorise intellectual humility and faith. Helen Swift continues this perspective in her chapter on love poetry. The lover's desire renders him peculiarly incapable of discerning the truth but this inability is itself willed for: the continuance of uncertainty is the precondition for the continuance of desire. Jean de Meun, Chaucer, and Lydgate are the subject of Nicolette Zeeman's contribution. She sees these authors turning the weapons of the scholastic philosophers against them in a systematic problematising of sanctioned epistemological, moral, social, and gender hierarchies. Next, Mishtooni Bose focuses on the role of opinion in the vernacular philosophical and moral works of Christine de Pizan and Bishop Reginald Pecock.

Notwithstanding the Introduction's disclaimer, Kantik Ghosh addresses heresy and the policing of intellectual debate in the trials of Richard Fleming, Jerome of Prague, and Jan Hus, all of whom were accused of following Wyclif. Fleming successfully defended himself on the grounds of academic debate, but Hus and Jerome found arguments for academic freedom powerless against the Inquisition and the stake. The volume concludes on a more upbeat note. Hester Goodenough Gelber argues that Holcot and Chaucer accepted an inevitable uncertainty in human knowledge but maintained an optimistic confidence that salvation might yet be achieved through good will. Finally, Sarah Kay examines Richard de Fournival's *Bestiaire d'Amours*, a rather charming text which humorously reshapes the medieval moralising bestiary into a rueful meditation on sexual love, simultaneously rejoicing in our shared animal nature while gesturing to our difference.

*Uncertain Knowledge* sheds new light on the complexity of medieval philosophical engagement, both within the academy and without, and succeeds admirably in combating the cliché of the Middle Ages as an Age of Faith. It should be of great interest to scholars of medieval literature, philosophy, and the history of ideas.

LOLA SHARON DAVIDSON, *The University of Technology Sydney*

**Drury**, John, *Music at Midnight: The Life and Poetry of George Herbert*, London, Allen Lane, 2013; cloth; pp. xix, 396; 27 b/w illustrations, 24 colour plates; R.R.P. £25.00, AU\$49.99; ISBN 9781846142482.

It is a measure of the humility that George Herbert attained over his lifespan of less than forty years that, when dying, he left his friend Nicholas Ferrar of Little Gidding the choice of publishing or burning *The Temple*, his collection of English poems: 'for I and it are the least of God's mercies'. Even allowing for the hagiographical tendencies of his biographer, Izaak Walton, Herbert's serene gamble with literary oblivion is a rarity in the lives of great poets.

Add to this his practical purpose for writing – that his poems should ‘turn to the advantage of any dejected poor soul’ – and his uniqueness emerges incontrovertibly.

*Music at Midnight* interweaves a deeply researched account of the poet’s ‘world’ with expositions of his best English poems, most of which lack precise dates of composition. John Drury discusses the poems, quoted in full, in relation to their known chronology, but primarily as they illuminate Herbert’s sequential attitudes and vocations, which Drury deduces from contemporary documents. ‘Love (III)’, the last poem in *The Temple* and Herbert’s ‘masterpiece’ (p. 1), opens the discussion and announces its theme-based method. It is high praise to be able to say that Herbert would have approved of this book.

The first ground for approval is truth, in that Drury weighs the evidence before endorsing or rejecting Walton’s ‘rapturous paragraph[s]’ (p. 199) on Herbert’s holiness. He reveals the young Herbert’s prissy concern with clothes and cleanliness, his over-valuing of his noble birth, his academic ambitions, and anxious manoeuvrings for the Cambridge University Oratorship, and his retreat, after ordination as deacon, into a limbo of indecision. Drury shows too that while Herbert’s ordination as priest and preferment to the parish of Bemerton was the outward sign of a spiritual breakthrough, it was not the beginning, as Walton asserted, ‘of the great sanctity of the short remainder of his holy life’. In fact, Herbert continued to struggle. The best evidence that he finally attained fulfilment is again his deathbed letter to Ferrar, where, quoting from the Order for Morning Prayer, he affirms that he has found ‘perfect freedom’ in Christ’s service.

Secondly, Herbert would have approved Drury’s directing of his book to an inclusive readership at every level of literary and theological sophistication, and of every religious brand or none. Expositions of the poems begin with the basics, explaining terms like ‘trochee’ and quoting scriptural and other allusions, but they go on to examine musical and mimetic techniques, and to explore both the heights of Herbert’s thinking and the depths of his spirituality. For example, Drury shows how ‘The Flower’ follows the narrator’s ‘errant intellectual and emotional stages’ on the way to discovering the ‘necessary truth’ that acceptance of ‘human mutability and mortality’ is an essential basis for happiness (p. 318); and his despair when reciprocity and dialogue with God fail in ‘Grief’ (p. 334).

*Music at Midnight* is a heartfelt and refreshing study, a gift for Herbert enthusiasts and first-time readers alike. For old debates over ‘metaphysical’ poetry, it substitutes a lively account of Herbert’s family friendship with John Donne, basing its approach on T. S. Eliot’s assertion of 1962, that ‘what is important is to apprehend the particular virtue, the unique flavour’ of Herbert and other poets of ‘the school of Donne’. Drury evades both the

Scylla of popularising his subject for an audience whose interests are religious only, and the Charybdis of abstract sociological analysis riddled by jargon, which is surely inappropriate here. The hardback edition, with its illustrations and endpaper reproductions of John Speed's 1616 maps of Middlesex and Wiltshire, is heartening evidence that the art of making fine books continues to flourish even in the Internet age. Descending directly from F. E. Hutchinson's edition (Oxford, 1941), Helen Vendler's study (Harvard, 1975), and Helen Wilcox's edition (Cambridge, 2007), Drury's book is the latest milestone in Herbert scholarship and interpretation.

CHERYL TAYLOR, *Griffith University*

**Dubin**, Nathaniel E., *The Fabliaux: A New Verse Translation*, New York, Liveright, 2013; cloth; pp. xxxi, 982; map; R.R.P. US\$29.95; ISBN 9780871403575.

Not since John Duval's translations of twenty fabliaux over twenty years ago has there been such a comprehensive English language collection published from the fabliaux corpus. Nathaniel E. Dubin's sixty-nine English translations are long overdue and have been much anticipated, certainly by this reviewer. *The Fabliaux: A New Verse Translation* is well credentialed with R. Howard Bloch, Sterling Professor of French at Yale University, providing a glowing endorsement in his Introduction.

Bloch introduces the fabliaux providing essential information for a reader new to the genre: extant numbers; geographical origin; audience; and a brief history of their reception. Bloch also stresses the genre's significance as an early form of literary realism and a window on the society that produced the works, as well as praising Dubin's translation skills in bringing to life the vitality of the genre. Dubin's Introduction serves as the translator's caveat. He takes time to explain and justify his translations with regard to word choice, metre, and the idiosyncrasies and similarities between English and Old French; each fabliau is provided with the original and facing page translation so that the Old French is readily available.

Considering the heterogeneity of the fabliaux, Dubin has divided his translations well into three distinct sections, although many could easily fit into any of the three groups. Section I, 'The Social Fabric', showcases the myriad social groups that constituted medieval society. Hence, through a reliance on stereotypes and humour, the knight, clergy, peasantry, and bourgeois are all represented with a few specific tradespeople present as well: money changers, a fisherman, a shit carter, and a pseudo doctor. Section II, 'The Comedy of Errors', considers the ways in which tricksters achieved their goals and how the fableors thus realised the genre's comedic constituent. The tales in this section reveal how the fableors used language in ingenious ways, for example, through euphemisms and lies, to bring about one character's



deception of another. The final section, 'Sinning, Sex and Saintliness', deals with moral issues and reveals a society's anxieties about human behaviour and Christian salvation.

Overall, this is a very welcome book and a valuable source to students who are not proficient in Old French but who have a scholarly interest in the genre. I agree with Bloch that the translations are erudite and capture much of the vitality that the fabliaux embody; I do, however, have a few comments to make regarding the target audience. Bloch states that this book was written for the general reader, yet Dubin states that he has supplied explanatory notes for the general reader and to 'assist students with difficult ... passages in the Old French' (p. xxxi). To my mind, I question the usefulness of the original text for a general readership or the provision of a list of extant fabliaux manuscripts. Conversely, those items are certainly useful for an academic audience; but an academic audience also requires so much more: more extensive notes on translation; a more comprehensive introduction to each section, arguably each tale; and a more recent bibliography (there are only three texts cited that have been published this century yet there is a wealth of contemporary critical studies available).

I appreciate that translating so many texts and to a very high standard is time consuming; however, I wonder if this book would have benefitted from a shared authorship, such as the DuVal and Eichmann combination of translator and commentator, as well as being multi-volumed. Notwithstanding, this is a very welcome text and will serve as an invaluable reference for many scholars embarking on a study of the fabliaux, and will be of great interest to the general reader.

KATHRYN L. SMITHIES, *The University of Melbourne*

**Gahtan**, Maia Wellington, ed., *Giorgio Vasari and the Birth of the Museum*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 296; 75 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781409456841.

According to editor, Maia Wellington Gahtan, this collection of cross-disciplinary essays provides the first comprehensive account of Giorgio Vasari, the man argued to have significantly shaped the modern museum. In Gahtan's Introduction, Vasari is described as a 'writer, collective, procession and festival impresario, exhibitor and architect of the Medici court' (p. 11). Vasari wrote many influential texts throughout his career including *Vite*, a collection of captioned paintings.

In order to unpack Vasari's significance, the collection is divided into four relatively equal parts. Part I, 'Vasari's Collections', explores the remnants of Vasari's life that all form part of his overall remaining collection. The section begins with an overview of how the homes of Vasari can be viewed as museums in themselves and is followed by two chapters on his other known collections.



Vasari's *Libro de' disegni*, his collection of Old Master drawings, was 'the most noted and documented collection of graphic art as well as the most varied and organic until beyond the sixteenth century' (p. 41). The final chapter in this section focuses on the epitaphs collected by Vasari in his biographies. All three chapters successfully argue that the nature of Vasari's collecting habits, and his conservation and display of artwork altered throughout his life. The three authors also argue that these collections set precedents for future modern collecting endeavours, creating criteria that could be applied to any collection.

Part II, 'Illustrium Imagines', comprises three chapters that all explore the importance of the portrait, delving into the religious, social, and cultural contexts behind Vasari's acquisitions. Artist Paolo Giovio is at the centre of the first chapter and appears in the second as an inspiration to Vasari, imagining the first museums as centres of preservation and notoriety. This context is very important in this work establishing why images and portraits became so valuable during Vasari's time. Rick Scorza's contribution discusses the lengths Vasari went to in order to gain the most authentic image of the pope. Authenticity meant memory preservation: Vasari himself wrote that his text on the images would be 'brief ... because their portraits ... will better illustrate the appearance of these men than any description could ever do' (p. 104). What this section adds to the book is that it really contextualises the importance of the portrait and how a rising respect for portrait painters allowed the development of museums and culminated with Vasari's *Vite* as a tool of memory preservation.

Logically, the next section of the book, Part III, 'Vasari's Exhibitions', delves further into the art exhibitions themselves. Much attention is given to Vasari's work for the Medici family. It is through the examples given here that a sense of his contribution to modern museums really begins to form. The creation of inventory lists, the planning of display areas, and the creation of themes and stories related to the artwork all link Vasari to modern day practices. This was especially apparent with the Palazzo Vecchio Ragionamenti, which drew visitors into a story told by the artwork. What is most enjoyable about this section is its reference to historiography and the debates about Vasari in other works. Claudia Conforti's chapter on the Uffizi draws on these debates adding a new layer of depth to the article. By communicating the information in this way, it becomes clear how Vasari's legacy has continued to perplex historians, architects, and others.

Finally, Part IV, 'Vasari's Museological Concepts and Their Afterlife', brings Vasari's legacy to life, through articles on the establishment of art schools and how his museum practices continued to influence others even after his death.

Overall, Gahtan has edited this work with much care and precision. Readers are led through logical, interesting, and strongly source-focused articles written by Vasari specialists. The constant use of Vasari's *Vite* and an individual adherence to the main themes of collecting, preserving, and exhibiting tie this collection together and provide well-articulated and researched chapters. This work is a clear example of how cross-disciplinary studies can truly be beneficial in exploring the source material available to a greater extent through different lenses.

REBECCA LUSH, *The University of Queensland*

**Griffiths**, Fiona J., and Julie **Hotchin**, eds, *Partners in Spirit: Women, Men, and Religious Life in Germany, 1100–1500* (Medieval Women: Texts and Contexts, 24), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 430; 15 b/w illustrations, 2 b/w line art; R.R.P. €100.00; ISBN 9782503540962.

With *Partners in Spirit*, the latest volume in the 'Medieval Women: Texts and Contexts' series, the editors, Fiona J. Griffiths and Julie Hotchin, have provided an important study for the relationship between men and women in medieval religious life. The twelve contributions that make up the volume deal with a diverse range of gender issues in Germany between the eleventh and sixteenth centuries, including the *cura monialium*, negotiation about spiritual and institutional authority, and networks of spiritual friendship between men and women. Many of the chapters also address largely understudied or under-examined historical phenomena, such as double monasteries of men and women, the institutions peculiar to medieval Germany known as the *Frauenstifte*, and lay and female religious networks attached to the monastic, canonical, and mendicant orders.

As Griffiths and Hotchin explain in their Introduction, the collection places particular emphasis on instances of religious and spiritual co-operation between men and women. The purpose in doing so is to broaden the current historiography in the field of medieval men and women's religiosity and dispel myths about male reluctance to engage in the spiritual oversight of women during the Middle Ages. The chapters which the editors have collected meet this challenge admirably. Although there is no denying that in the late medieval period male-dominated religious orders were increasingly concerned about their responsibilities towards women, each chapter relativises this concern by paying attention to what is representative, rather than exceptional, about their particular case studies.

Many of the studies collected in this volume provide a unique and detailed investigation of literature largely unknown in English language scholarship. One important example is the final essay of the volume by Sabine Klapp which examines the role played by male canons in the *Frauenstift* attached

to St Stephan in Strasbourg. Klapp argues that these men, who generally came under the authority of female canonesses, were integral parts of the institutional structure of the *Stift* and shared authority with the women. Griffiths's contribution investigates the relationship between the sisters of Rupertsberg and the spiritual friend of Hildegard of Bingen who came to live among them, the monk Guibert of Gembloux. Griffiths argues that although Guibert was alive to criticisms about the conduct of monks living with women, he seemed to prefer his pastoral work at Rupertsberg to his own monastery and found religious and spiritual inspiration in his active relationship with the sisters. Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, in another important essay, examines a similar phenomenon in the pastoral relationships between the mendicants and beguines of Würzburg.

Extraordinary men and women also receive some consideration. Wybren Scheepsma examines the late thirteenth-century Dominican visionary, Hendrik van Leuven, and considers what his surviving literary *corpus* can tell us about his interaction with spiritual women. Anthony Ray offers an in-depth analysis of the epistolary exchange between the Cistercian monk Thomas, *cantor* of Villers, and his sister Alice, a nun at the convent Parc-les-Dames. A highly original and insightful chapter from Sara S. Poor examines the tradition of the Pseudo-Eckhartian treatise, *Schwesterkatrei*, and how its inversion of gendered spiritual authority led to its inclusion in the fifteenth-century devotional manual of Dorothy of Hof. These studies, which explore the themes of mysticism, are some of the most engaging in the entire volume.

Many of the contributions in *Partners in Spirit* have been translated into English from German or Dutch; while some, such as the contribution from Susan Marti on double monasteries in manuscript illumination, have previously appeared in print elsewhere in their original language. It is one of the strengths of the volume that it makes this scholarship available to a wider English-speaking audience. The translations are of a very high quality, although, in a number of the translated essays, occasional fidelity to Germanic idiom provides some jarring English syntax. This is only a minor complaint, and scholars familiar with German writing (whether in original or in translation) will not find these moments too unbearable. Often where primary and secondary material has been quoted in text in the original language, English translations are provided, so readers unfamiliar with Middle High German or Dutch can understand important extracts. However, this is not always the case for footnotes and references.

This volume will appeal to scholars of gender, religious life, medieval Germany, and mysticism. There is certainly much material that will be of interest to historians concerned with the relationships between established religious orders and women, whether they are religious themselves or members of the pious laity. The volume offers an important intervention in the

historiography of gendered religious experience and insight for new avenues of research in English-language scholarship. It is highly recommended.

SAMUEL BAUDINETTE, *Monash University*

**Hemptinne**, Thérèse de, Veerle **Fraeters**, and María Eugenia **Góngora**, eds, *Speaking to the Eye: Sight and Insight through Text and Image (1150–1650)* (Medieval Identities: Socio-Cultural Spaces, 2), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xx, 311; 8 colour, 37 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503534206.

This collection is the result of a Flemish–Chilean bilateral project, ‘Speaking to the Eye: Text, Image, and Gender in the Middle Ages and Early Modern Times’. It is interdisciplinary in approach, but does emphasise literary, art historical, philosophical, and theological approaches. Each of the writers highlights the complex cultural meanings found in the texts and images being studied. The book is divided into three sections – Spiritual Vision, Text and Image Interactions, and Agency of Pictures – and is bookended by two essays that set the chronological boundaries of the work, and bring to the fore its central theme of exploring ‘the tension between iconophilic and iconoclastic reflections on the nature and function of images’ in the medieval and early modern periods.

Ineke van ‘t Spijker’s chapter on Hugh of St-Victor and Richard of St-Victor looks at the important role given to the visual and the visible in their understandings of knowledge and thought. Both used images not only as explanatory diagrams but also as vehicles for thinking in their discussions of the thinking process. In their writings, where they reflect the influence of the writings of St Augustine, they provide a more nuanced role for imagery. While this chapter looks at how the Victorine brothers included roles for images and the imagination in their quest for spiritual perfection through contemplation and meditation, the next three deal with visionary texts from the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, examining works by Hildegard of Bingen, Hadewijck of Brabant, and Simon of Aulne. In their studies of the first two, María Eugenia Góngora and Veerle Fraeters take specific visionary texts for focused analysis, while Jeroen Deploige looks at the use of spiritual clairvoyance in an account of the life of a Cistercian lay brother. This was recorded in an illustrated revision of his life from the seventeenth century.

Henry Suso also features in this collection. Suso’s use of images in his spiritual mentoring of nuns marked a shift in Dominican teaching, transforming *Andachtsbilder* into a central part of spiritual life. The imagery found in his texts also provides a fascinating insight into ideas about prayer and visionary experiences. Youri Desplenter examines Middle Dutch psalters, showing the use of these books by women, especially tertiaries, who adapted liturgical ritual into a quieter form of private prayer. The third chapter in this

second section looks at a fifteenth-century Middle French rhyming chronicle from the Premonstratensian monastery of Florette. The chronicle's author defended the writing of history through allegorical writings combined with unusual illustrations, some of which transform and complement the meanings found in the text.

The final section looks at paintings from the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. These include the extraordinary Beato Chiarito tabernacle in Florence, the central panel of which shows an image of the Apostles drinking the blood of Christ via tubes. The image highlights both Christ's suffering and the spiritual nourishment it provides. The second chapter, by Stijn Bussels, looks at the 'Diptych of the Lentulus Letter', which juxtaposes a profile image of Christ with a purportedly contemporaneous description of his appearance. Caroline van Eck's final chapter on Bellini's *Pieta* combines Alfred Gell's ideas about agency in art with classical rhetoric and Renaissance responses to art, to explore early modern ideas about visual persuasion. The epilogue of the collection is a discussion of Huygen's poem written to console a friend whose eyesight was diminishing, which draws together both Augustinian understandings of spiritual insight, with ideas drawn from texts like that of Thomas à Kempis.

This is a fascinating and varied collection that tracks shifting understandings of the uses of images from the medieval to the early modern period. The range of scholarship and ideas makes this a valuable collection, which highlights the importance of studying medieval and early modern visual culture.

JUDITH COLLARD, *The University of Otago*

**Hillman**, Richard, and Pauline **Ruberry-Blanc**, eds, *Female Transgression in Early Modern Britain: Literary and Historical Explorations*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 236; 4 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472410450.

Richard Hillman and Pauline Ruberry-Blanc's anthology examines fictional representations of female transgression alongside cases recorded in historical documents. Rather than viewing this basic comparative approach as reductive, the editors claim 'that the methodological divergences' between the majority of literary scholars and social scientists can be combined (p. 3). They also argue that their use of 'transgression' rather than 'crime' in the collection's title emphasises the imaginative construction of women through fictional and factual interpretations.

The first essay by Hillman examines 'the incest motif' in Shakespeare's *Pericles* (p. 15). Hillman argues that volume 7 of François de Belleforest's *Histoires tragiques*, dismissed by the play's critics, was the source that Shakespeare used for the incestuous act. Shakespeare goes further than Belleforest, though, by

making the king's daughter the instigator of the sexual transgression, rather than a passive victim who is persuaded by her nurse to find sexual pleasure with her father. In an important essay, Hillman finds that early modern women were not simply the fragile damsels in distress stereotyped in Romance, but were actually given agency through the transgressive act.

In an equally fascinating essay, Diane Purkiss reads *Macbeth* through bodies and markings as transgressive spaces. She first examines the cauldron scene as eroticising the relics with which saints are associated. Purkiss then analyses in the play and comparable sources how the Jew and the witch become interchangeable, the differences between a hard and soft body, and the implications of babies' bodies being imbued with supernatural power. Following on from David Nicol's work on *The Witch of Edmonton*, Ruberry-Blanc focuses on how that play's social and demonic aspects intersect. She also investigates what the play's complex allusions and intertextual references connected to the black dog would have meant to its contemporary audience. The intriguing conclusion to Ruberry-Blanc's well-written essay finds an uneasy comparison between the Marlovian scholarly 'over-reacher' and the old woman as witch.

Frédérique Fouassier-Tate studies negative constructions of the early modern prostitute. Her mainly descriptive discussion of the prostitute as the reviled and desirable other is dated. A more accomplished essay is Pascale Drouet's analysis of the infamous Mary Frith alias Moll Cutpurse. He finds in the colourful fictional representations of, and historical documents referring to, Moll Cutpurse an intriguing connection. Whether dealing in stolen goods or depicted as a cross-dressing, warrior woman, Moll is a subversive and allusive figure who challenges patriarchy.

The importance of a woman's marital status in English law is discussed by Marisha Caswell. She examines trials in early modern London for infanticide and petty treason to argue how the two crimes are affected by marriage. In an essay that relies solely on historical law records and Acts, Caswell notes how a woman's marital status may incriminate or acquit her. James Sharpe makes creative use of the editors' rubric for combining fact and fiction. He studies the role of women in the pre-trial stage of infanticide cases in Cheshire. Sharpe also analyses the accounts of female witnesses in cases of murdered women and fights between men resulting in death. His essay establishes the importance of women in enforcing or challenging the law.

Anne-Marie Kilday challenges the belief that women only have a peripheral involvement in the highly violent crimes of assault and homicide. She examines cases in Scotland relating to the Scots law that a married woman is held culpable for the crime she commits even if her husband is present. Kilday finds that violent women, rather than acting as the stereotyped image of gentle femininity, were just as brutal as their male counterparts.

With bastardy, Jennine Hurl-Eamon finds a crime mostly attributed to poor women. Her essay is illuminating for challenging the literary construction of soldier-fathers as jack-the-lads who engaged in loveless unions with licentious women. Hurl-Eamon's research of eighteenth-century records, that appears to be indebted to John Black, implies more long-lasting emotional attachments.

The collection finishes nicely with Krista Kesselring investigating how married women lost most of the family property after their husbands' convictions in early modern England. She focuses on the fictive and factual legal tension between women being seen as criminal accomplices who deserved punishment and innocent victims of their husbands' crimes.

The first three essays in this collection demonstrate the strengths of analysing literature alongside its factual context for creative insights. The anthology's comparative approach, though, mostly lends itself to a fact-versus-fiction debate, if literature is examined at all. Despite these criticisms, the collection is worthwhile for students and academics interested in the subject.

FRANK SWANNACK, *The University of Salford*

**Hooke**, Della, *Trees in Anglo-Saxon England: Literature, Lore and Landscape* (Anglo-Saxon Studies, 13), Woodbridge, Boydell, 2013; paperback; pp. x, 310; 6 b/w plates, 21 b/w figures, 3 b/w tables; R.R.P. £17.99; ISBN 9781843838296.

It is a welcome development to see this 2010 title now reprinted in paperback, given the wide appeal of this study. Della Hooke is well known as a scholar of the Anglo-Saxon landscape, having produced several monographs and numerous articles in the field of study over the past thirty-five years. Here, the trees of Anglo-Saxon England, individually and collectively, are discussed from all conceivable points of view, including religious, folkloric, medicinal, economic, and geopolitical, in a manner accessible to the non-specialist.

Part I, 'Tree Symbolism', explores, across four chapters, trees and groves in pre-Christian belief, the tree in Christian tradition, and the syncretism of Christian and non-Christian beliefs in Anglo-Saxon England, moving on to trees in Anglo-Saxon literature, and the continuing mythology and folklore of trees in England up to the present. The narrative tends to the eclectic at times, but the virtue of this part of the book is its breadth, and its usefulness as a summary of ideas such as the World Tree, and the function of sacred groves as sites of worship. The chapter on literature provides an extensive anthology of passages dealing with trees. The focus is predominantly upon writing in the Old English vernacular, but Irish texts are included also. In a few instances, the sources relied upon could have been adapted and clarified for the lay reader. Cardale's 1829 *Boethius* is cited both for the OE text and the modern English translation; Sedgefield's later edition and translation would have been



a better choice (superseded by Godden and Irvine's new edition, of course, but too late for this publication).

Part II, 'Trees and Woodland in the Anglo-Saxon Landscape', is based on the kind of multidisciplinary research that is at the core of Hooke's work. The archaeology of field systems, pollen and soil analysis, and related methods of study have demonstrated that modification of the forest landscape is apparent as far back as the Mesolithic period, and significant by the late Bronze Age, when the amount of woodland present had been reduced to little more than is found today. Nor did the Anglo-Saxons encounter large tracts of dense regenerative forest when they arrived. Rather, the available evidence suggests a continuity of agrarian practice, within which woodland was managed and exploited for fuel, fodder, and building materials, with varying kinds of practice and degrees of intensity as populations and patterns of settlement evolved. For the latter part of the Anglo-Saxon period, documentary evidence provides new insights in the form of place-names involving tree species, or references to kinds of woodland, and of charters, where references to individual trees or woodland appear frequently in the boundary descriptions. Law codes, too, provide information. Place-name elements like the ubiquitous *leah* (see fig. 7) present many problems of usage and interpretation; Hooke takes the reader through the relevant research and debate with admirable clarity. As fig. 14 (showing the distribution of references to oak and ash in charters and place-names) demonstrates, the evidence from charters is largely from the south and west, and within the charters themselves, the focus is on trees that are liminal rather than central to the estates in question. Yet such materials can be a source of rich insight when carefully handled as they are in this book.

Part III examines the distribution, use, mythology, and folklore of individual tree species, organised according to their usual environment: wood-pasture ('forest'), wet places, open or planned countryside, and others mentioned in charters and place-names such as the fruit and nut species. The section on the apple, for example, provides a fascinating overview of the tree and its fruit. In OE folklore, it is mentioned in *The Nine Twigs of Woden*, and its mythic potency in Celtic and other mythologies is outlined. Its medicinal properties (both fruit and bark) are mentioned in the *Leechdoms*, and it is the commonest fruit mentioned in place-names and charters, where patterns of settlement and domestic economy may be traced. Significantly, perhaps, it appears in several early hundred names, indicating that the tree marked a meeting place or the estate where the hundred met.

*Trees in Anglo-Saxon England* is clearly written, well-illustrated, and impressively broad-ranging in its methodology. The footnotes and bibliography make it an invaluable resource for further study. One desideratum I have is that



the next edition should include a full index of the place-names mentioned, in addition to the helpful general index.

GREG WAITE, *The University of Otago*

**Hourihane**, Colum, ed., *Manuscripta Illuminata: Approaches to Understanding Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts* (Index of Christian Art: Occasional Papers, 16), University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2014; paperback; pp. 286; 168 colour, 10 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$35; ISBN 9780983753735.

This collection of thirteen essays is the latest in the occasional papers series from the Index of Christian Art at Princeton. The essays are the proceedings of a conference – surprisingly, the first organised by the Index dedicated solely to manuscripts – held in 2013 to mark the important publication, *Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the Princeton University Library*. In his preface, Colum Hourihane explains that the broad brief to speakers was ‘to advance our understanding of the medieval manuscript’. This may seem vague as a unifying principle; however, the contributors, who are among the most eminent scholars in the field, provide exemplary essays on current research in manuscript studies.

Several authors give detailed descriptions and analyses of individual manuscripts or groups of related manuscripts. These include Adelaide Bennett’s impressive examination of the physical character, contents, and patronage of the Chambly Hours, a remarkably tiny (58 × 40 mm) Book of Hours donated to the Princeton University Art Museum in 2010. The subject of Walter Cahn’s contribution is late fourteenth-century diplomat and provost of Paris, Guillaume de Tignonville, and his ‘Dits moraux des philosophes’, a translation from Latin of wise sayings by ancient authors. This, his only substantial work, was widely read and illuminated and is extant in some sixty-eight manuscripts listed by Cahn, nearly all of which were produced in northern France for an aristocratic audience. Patricia Stirnemann’s focus is an Italian manuscript of the *Lives of the Caesars* by Suetonius in the Princeton University Library, MS Kane 44. Made in 1433, the manuscript is one of eight illuminated by the Lombard Master of the *Vitae Imperatorum*. Stirnemann examines the manuscript’s lavish illumination and concludes that it was made for a person close to Filippo Maria Visconti.

Other essays devoted primarily to single texts include Marilyn Aronberg Lavin’s summary of her recent book on the late fifteenth-century Netherlandish blockbook, the *Canticum Cantorum* (*Song of Songs*). Lavin regards it as the ‘Sistine ceiling of woodcuts’ and makes a claim for the anonymous artist (or woodcut designer?) to be named the Master of the *Canticum Cantorum*. In his essay, Don C. Skemer examines Princeton University Library, MS Taylor 22, which includes an eighty-line verse epitaph by Carthusian John Shirwood for a

canon of Exeter Cathedral. The manuscript is illustrated with two vivid death images and Skemer explores the contemporary 'cult of death' exemplified by this 'portable epitaph'.

Other contributors are concerned with issues extraneous to manuscripts' materiality, or as Henry Mayr-Harting puts it, he is 'more of a bee than a botanist'. In his study of the iconography and texts of several late tenth- and early eleventh-century Ottonian liturgical manuscripts, Mayr-Harting argues that, contrary to the view that the division between liturgical and private prayer only developed in the twelfth century and later, Ottonians did experience religious interiority. Marc Michael Epstein looks at a range of illuminated manuscripts made for Jewish audiences to establish medieval Jewish 'typologies of temporality', where a secret language, a 'strategy of implied ensuring action' has been developed in illustration in order to avoid censure or accusations of heresy. In their contribution, Richard Rouse and Mary Rouse elegantly demonstrate the wealth of information concerning manuscripts that can be found in documentary evidence such as wills.

Illumination and artistic style is the prime concern of other authors. Stella Panayotova analyses the style of the so-called Rohan Masters as found in the Hours of Isabella Stuart in the Fitzwilliam Library, Cambridge. Aided by technical analysis, she distinguishes three separate hands – the Rohan Master, Giac Master, and Madonna Master – and argues for their intimate collaboration in the illumination of the manuscript. Lucy Freeman Sandler, on the other hand, eschews the notion of 'hands' as she believes that artists were more interested in conforming to a group style than displaying artistic individuality. In her essay on a 'homeless' manuscript, Princeton, MS Garrett 35, which lacks any indication of origin, patronage, or date, she argues for close attention to the book as a product of decision-making, such as those necessarily made by individual artists in forming a painted image. Elizabeth J. Moody suggests that grisaille illuminations could be used for didactic effect or, as can be seen with Flemish prayer book, Princeton, MS 223, a desire for aristocratic associations.

The remaining essays are mostly concerned with patronage, reception, and the social aspects of manuscripts. Anne Rudolf Stanton discusses several thirteenth-century English prayer books, showing how they were shaped by successive owners over the decades with 'continued physical intervention' in the form of inscriptions and additions. Similarly, Virginia Reinburg shows how Books of Hours were 'archives of prayer', all-purpose devotional books that were fashioned by their owners into personal possessions that preserved memory.

This generously illustrated book is a welcome and valuable contribution to the field of manuscript studies.

HILARY MADDOCKS, *Melbourne, Victoria*

**Houston**, Chloë, *The Renaissance Utopia: Dialogue, Travel and the Ideal Society*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 198; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472425034.

In 2016, it will be 500 years since the original publication of Thomas More's *Utopia*. In that 500 years, research into utopian studies has developed to such an extent that two large international utopian studies societies have thrived and continue to grow. With *The Renaissance Utopia*, Chloë Houston makes a significant contribution to this field. Houston firstly reviews utopian literature from 1516 to the 1650s; then examines the utopian mode of literature, the dialogue. The dialogue was the literary form used by Thomas More in *Utopia* and it continued to be central to utopian literature, even though conventional forms of dialogue ceased to be employed in literature generally. Finally, she demonstrates that the 1640s was a uniquely active period in the history of utopian literature.

Houston contends that Tudor dialogues added to the English utopian mode of discourse in the sixteenth century. To demonstrate this, she examines lesser-known works, such as Thomas Nicholls's *A Pleasant Dialogue between a lady called Listra, and a Pilgrim: Concerning the Gouvernement and Commonweale of the great Prouince of Crangalor* (1579), and Thomas Lupton's *Sivqila, too Good to be True* (1580). Both books use the dialogue literary form. Houston believes that the educational association of the reformation of English morals with the reformation of society more broadly can be seen in these two books, demonstrating that the dialogue was uniquely appropriate for the expression of utopian ideals and an important part of a humanist education. These texts represent a shift in utopian discourse away from More's irony, satire, and philosophical enquiry to a more social and moral approach.

Although the book is essentially about the English utopian traditions, Houston analyses the decline of the dialogue in the Italian Dominican monk Tommaso Campanella's *City of the Sun* written in Italian in 1602 and first published in Frankfurt in Latin in 1623, and the German Lutheran pastor Johann Valentin Andreae's *Christianopolis* published in 1619. She claims that the emphasis both Campanella and Andreae placed on social change, more practical aspects of Utopia, particularly scientific knowledge, and the introduction of conversation in the dialogue, made an important method of teaching for the narrator and was meant to be educational for the reader. While Andreae adopts the form of a travel narrative, both incorporated elements of the dialogue that demonstrate its continued association with the utopian mode, without the dialogue form being integral to that mode. While More intimated that humanity could improve itself morally and socially and thus make an ideal society possible, Campanella and Andreae presented this as a serious goal that not only could be but should be achieved.

Francis Bacon's *New Atlantis* represented a change in the use of the utopian mode of dialogue. It was not a satire, irony, or philosophical enquiry as More's *Utopia* was, nor did it follow the moral and social approach of the Tudor utopians, or even the practical application and educational adaption of Campanella and Andreae; but Bacon brought the institution to the centre of Utopia as a serious means of promoting social change. In seventeenth-century thought, scientific and religious activities generally overlapped and Bacon had a tendency to describe one sphere in terms of another. The purpose of religion in his utopian Bensalem, with its unity and stability, is to support natural philosophy. Conversation is central to the practice and communication of the institutionalisation of natural philosophy. In the house of Salomon, the dialogue between the father and the narrator is one-sided and monological. Conversation becomes the means to communicate information in the *New Atlantis* but the use of dialogue in the text demonstrates its continuing importance in the utopian mode of literature.

The highlights of the book are the last two chapters, which demonstrate that Utopian thought proliferated in the 1640s particularly with the growth of the millenarianism that focused its attention on the ideal society. The political instability and religious fervour of the time changed the form of utopian discourse in two ways. First, the development of utopian narrative fiction represented the beginnings of the utopian novel; secondly, it became less imaginative in the hands of reformers who wished to promote social reformation, and who rejected fictional conversations while promoting the concept of real reforms. However, the optimism of the fulfilment of their millenarianist hopes soon turned to disappointment when the Cromwellian Protectorate did not live up to its political expectations.

*The Renaissance Utopia* threads the complex nuances of utopian literature of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries into a tapestry of superb scholarship. It is an extremely interesting book that is well written and easy to read. The book should be in the library of anyone who is interested in English history and literature of this period as well as utopian studies.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle*

**Johnston**, Michael, *Romance and the Gentry in Late Medieval England*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 320; 11 b/w illustrations, 4 maps; R.R.P. £55.00; ISBN 9780199679782.

Michael Johnston's *Romance and the Gentry in Late Medieval England* is an impressive first book. His thesis that late medieval English romances played a part in creating a gentry identity is convincing both in terms of his argument and in terms of the research underlying it. He draws connections between scholarship that is still too often isolated – literary, social, palaeographical,

and codicological – and shows that there is strong evidence that romances played a role in shaping the burgeoning gentry identity.

There are six chapters, an appendix of the composition and circulation of the nine romances analysed in the text, and a very comprehensive bibliography. In the first chapter – aptly titled ‘A Watered-Down Version of Nobility’ – Johnston looks at how the cultural concerns of the gentry varied from both those of the nobility above them, and the peasantry below them. Chapter 2 explores the literary history of the romances, showing that romances could function as apt resources for exploring class identity from the gentry point of view. In the third chapter, Johnston examines the manuscript evidence of his nine chosen romances, making a good case for the production occurring in ‘a provincial setting for a provincial public’ (p. 127). Chapter 4 looks at two manuscripts that originated in Derbyshire (the Findern Anthology and the Heege Manuscript), detailing the political and social upheavals the gentry faced at the time these manuscripts were created. Robert Thornton and his impressive copying efforts are the subject of Chapter 5, with Johnston demonstrating the ideological connections between the socio-economic and political realities of Thornton’s life with those portrayed in the romances. The last chapter concerns itself with the Ireland family, whose romance-only compilation illustrates, argues Johnston, a more ‘equitable ideal of the aristocracy’ (p. 206) than that of Thornton.

The gentry’s uncertain standing within the hierarchical power structure of late medieval England is frequently dealt with in romances in a fantastic manner; for example, both *Sir Degrevant* and *Sir Isumbras* see their gentry heroes ascend the social hierarchy from manor to court, gaining social and political power.

The power struggles between the noble classes often involved the fates of the gentry classes, which resulted in a delicate balancing of power by the gentry themselves. The nobles held power through their control of lands and official positions as Justices of the Peace, Sheriffs, and the like, which meant that good relations with those above were essential. Yet these relationships could be fragile, as all gentry families would be striving to be on the good side of the powerful nobles. Johnston argues that romances like *Sir Degrevant* ‘did powerful ideological work’ (p. 201) for gentry readers, allowing them to imagine that moral or martial ability could gain them economic independence. The reality was, of course, the opposite, as Thornton himself experienced during the Wars of the Roses, when the nobility was divided. The romances often call attention to the social gradations in late medieval England, highlighting the protagonist’s status. Yet, despite the often-grave discrepancy in status, the protagonist manages to come to a positive end, an unlikely, if not impossible, event in reality.

Johnston's analysis of the social, political, and cultural environment in which these romances were produced and read, makes for a convincing argument. For example, Johnston details how Robert Thornton's Yorkshire was 'teeming with nobility' (p. 206), resulting in a politically and economically distressing environment, which, Johnston argues, is seen in the themes of the romances Thornton chose to copy and read. In contrast with Thornton's troubled Yorkshire, the Ireland family's collection of romances mediate the daily economic threats by focusing on aristocratic largesse.

The attention to palaeographical and codicological detail is impressive. The footnotes are extensive, not only covering the significant works relating to the theme in question, but also frequently highlighting areas of modern scholarly dissent, providing both (or more) sides of an argument. Johnston has added greatly to our understanding of both the genre of medieval romance and its consumers, resulting in a book that is both satisfying in its conclusions and inspiring in its scope. It will be of interest to scholars from a variety of research fields: ranging from literary studies to social history, from palaeographers and codicologists, to economic historians.

DEBORAH SEILER, *The University of Western Australia*

**Kastan**, David Scott, *A Will to Believe: Shakespeare and Religion*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 176; R.R.P. £25.00; ISBN 9780199572892.

This slender but significant book grew out of a series of lectures David Scott Kastan delivered on the subject of Shakespeare and religion. In the last twenty-odd years, the field of Shakespeare and religion has become exceedingly active. Richard McCoy justifiably calls this academic overabundance 'a bit of a stampede' (*Faith in Shakespeare* (Oxford University Press, 2013), p. ix). Amid such noise and confusion, Kastan's book has arrived as a concise and prudent addition.

Kastan eschews religious partisanship, which has often plagued the field of Shakespeare and religion. The short introductory section of this book rules out making exclusive claims about Shakespeare's personal religious beliefs. Kastan deftly illuminates the pitfalls and futility of such an approach. Any religious sectarianism in Shakespeare studies with its subjective agenda and conjectural readings of the plays inevitably turns into pulp fiction.

But to say that Shakespeare was not a Catholic rebel or recusant is not to argue that Shakespeare's works exclusively fly the 'Protestant' banner. Even though religious allusions are pervasive in Shakespeare's works, they do not 'display the same kind of religious concern or commitment as Spenser's or Milton's verse' (p. 4). During Shakespeare's lifetime, the boundaries between 'Protestant' and 'Catholic' often overlapped. Shakespeare's plays refuse to settle for doctrinal rigidity in their representation of Christianity.

The second section addresses in detail the claims of a 'Catholic' Shakespeare that have recently proliferated in Shakespeare studies. Kastan notes that before England adopted the Reformation in the 1530s, all English subjects had been Catholics, which included Shakespeare's parents. The newly reformed England carried many residues of the older, traditional faith. Kastan underlines the tendency of the 'Catholic' Shakespeare proponents to rely too heavily on slim evidence. Much has been made about the reported discovery of a Catholic 'Spiritual Testament' in 1757 in a house owned by Shakespeare's father. Kastan argues that even if we believe in the document's authenticity it does not prove John Shakespeare's actual beliefs (p. 23). Furthermore, the claims of John's impassioned recusancy are undermined by the fact that seven of his children were baptised in the reformed rites, and that as the Chamberlain of Stratford he was complicit in the iconoclastic defacing and destruction of the material reminders of Catholicism (p. 25). Still, even if we indulge the claim that John was an active (albeit secret) Catholic, it cannot serve as a proof that William Shakespeare practised 'Catholic' activism through his plays to undermine the 'Protestant' establishment.

In the third section, Kastan assesses the Catholic content of Shakespeare's plays. It should not surprise us if the plays set in pre-Reformation England or Italy feature priests and friars: these plays evoke 'romance details' rather than 'Romanist' theology (p. 50). The plays' various Catholic characters and dense Catholic allusions did not alarm the Protestant authorities. Catholicism might have been vilified in Protestant polemics, 'but for most English Protestants Catholicism was native and familiar' (p. 56). In other words, it was a culture saturated with residual Catholicism. Kastan also reminds us that the likable Catholic friars in Shakespeare's plays are 'mendicant priests' and not 'high clergy' who would likely have appeared threatening to Shakespeare's Protestant audience or the authorities. On the other hand, Shakespeare often used anti-Catholic polemic that would appeal to his audience like 'much English patriotic writing in the 1590s' (p. 60). Even so, Kastan argues that Shakespeare's fictional depictions cannot be used to ascertain his own personal religious beliefs.

The fourth section, 'Conversion and Cosmopolitanism', which focuses primarily on Jewish Shylock and Moorish Othello, deals with Shakespeare's depiction of non-Christian religions, along with racial and ethnic identities considered foreign in early modern England. Kastan draws on various Shakespeare plays to conclude that, generally, the depictions of foreign race and ethnicity are commensurate with the deep prejudices extant at the time: Shakespeare the playwright played to the prejudices of his audience.

The fifth and final chapter analyses Shakespeare's appropriation of religion in *Hamlet*. While acknowledging the extensive religious allusions in the play, Kastan sees them as plot devices rather than doctrinal statements.



Kastan notes that Hamlet's intense grief at the beginning of the play is caused because he misses his dear father and 'not the Sarum rite' (p. 126). Likewise, Kastan disagrees with Stephen Greenblatt's observation that the play is about a Protestant hero who is 'haunted by a distinctly Catholic ghost' (p. 134).

Thus, the book ends by repeating its sensible conclusion: for dramatic purposes, Shakespeare deeply engaged with the religious beliefs of his day, but it is erroneous to read systematic and sectarian theology in his creative works.

RAJIV THIND, *The University of Queensland*

**Lenz, Tanya S.**, *Dreams, Medicine, and Literary Practice: Exploring the Western Literary Tradition Through Chaucer* (Cursor Mundi, 18), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 212; 2 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503534817.

The originality of this book purports to lie in its consideration of the role of medicine in Chaucer's oeuvre. The connection between dreams and medicine having been lost in our modern era of scientific materialism, contemporary scholarship has largely ignored Chaucer's frequent references to medicine and accordingly 'no previous work has specifically addressed the poetic intersection of medicine and dreams in Chaucer' (p. 17).

After a brief Introduction on the relationship between dreams and medicine in Greco-Roman antiquity and the Middle Ages, Tanya S. Lenz proceeds to an analysis of various poems, chronologically considered so as to bring out the development of the author's reflection on his own literary practice. It is this reflection that emerges as the dominant theme of the book, with dreams and medicine providing the vehicles through which this meditation may be conducted. The works considered are the *Book of the Duchess*, the *House of Fame*, the *Parliament of Fowls*, *Troilus and Criseyde*, the Prologue to the *Legend of Good Women*, and the Nun's Priest's Tale from the *Canterbury Tales*. The first three are dream vision poems while the last three make extensive use of dreams. As for medicine, Chaucer does indeed reference the medical tradition, particularly as it enters into the continuing debate on the origin and truth of dreams as part of the broader field of conflicting claims to truth and epistemological certainty. Moreover, he is clearly learned in these matters. That said, it is essentially through metaphors of sickness and healing that medicine enters the text in service to the overriding literary concern.

The Duchess of the book of that name was John of Gaunt's wife, Blanche of Lancaster, who, along with her father, sister, and mother-in-law, Queen Philippa, died of the plague. Terrible as the Black Death was, I find it difficult to credit the assertion that, 'In England during the period of



1348–50, between eighty and ninety per cent of the population died' (p. 24). Putting that aside, Lenz makes a strong case that the inadequacy of medical knowledge to deal with the plague and the development of new theories of contagion in response to the catastrophe are an important theme of the poem. Lenz sees the contagion motif functioning even more strongly in *Troilus and Criseyde* where it is Pandarus who operates as the agent of contagion, infecting Criseyde with Troilus's love-sickness. In both poems, Chaucer is seen to be playing with the Galenic theory of the humours as well as the conventions of courtly love. While modern literary scholars are familiar with the latter, they are probably far less acquainted with the former than Chaucer's own audience would have been, so subtle references to it may well have been overlooked. With the *House of Fame* and the *Parliament of Fowls*, the focus is more purely on the ambivalent nature of literary practice, and its potential, like dreams, to mislead or inspire, to harm or to heal. Chaucer's role as a translator made him particularly sensitive to the ethical issues involved in transmitting a tradition. In both the *House of Fame*, which explicitly addresses the dangers of writing, and the Prologue to the *Legend of Good Women*, he seems at times uneasy with the misogynist undertone of his sources.

Lenz's own approach to translation is idiosyncratic and arbitrary. Short in-text translations generally receive a modern English translation, though not always. The many lengthier indented quotations are glossed with random words whose selection seems to defy all logic. The glosses are frequently similes for easily understood words while more obscure words in the quote are simply ignored. To give one instance, 'comlynesse' is glossed as 'graciousness' yet one sentence later we are told his 'remarks concern her comely dancing, singing' (pp. 40–41). If we are still using the same word for the same thing, spelling apart, why is it translated as something else? It is, of course, a matter of opinion and audience as to whether Chaucer requires translation but, if he does, one should at least attempt a consistent faithfulness to the original.

These annoyances should not take away from the great interest of the book. It is a sophisticated, complex, and sensitive analysis and a spirited defence of both dreams and literature as a means of healing for ourselves and our communities. Lenz has read widely in the immense field of Chaucerian scholarship. She has found a fresh perspective to it and her contribution is a stimulating and valuable one that does credit to her subject's genius.

LOLA SHARON DAVIDSON, *The University of Technology Sydney*

**Lisy-Wagner**, Laura, *Islam, Christianity and the Making of Czech Identity, 1453–1683* (Transculturalisms, 1400–1700), Farnham, Ashgate, 2013; hardback; pp. 214; 6 colour, 5 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9781409431657.

This is a courageous and ambitious undertaking. The author examines narratives about the Czech lands wherein Czechs played central roles and Czech identity was developed in relation to both East and West. The main focus of this book is on looking east and interacting with Islam and the Ottoman Empire. Laura Lisy-Wagner argues that the writings by Czechs that she has investigated are of considerably more significance than simply reflecting Czech attitudes toward Muslims. There is, in a real sense, a melding of East and West that results in the creation of liminal space and identity. Her study builds toward the conclusion that the narratives give voice to perspectives from the frontiers of Europe shedding light on historic binaries and accentuating what it means to be European, non-European, Christian, or Muslim. In these textual narratives, Lisy-Wagner believes such boundaries are ultimately rendered meaningless. Adopting the idea of beaches and islands from the work of Greg Denning on cultural and colonial encounters in Oceania, Lisy-Wagner suggests that her texts from early modern Europe provide a rhetorical space in which different cultures could meet and in these rhetorical spaces, identities could be challenged, disassembled, and reconstructed. In this way, national and cultural identities are subordinated to wider influences and factors. Notions of monolithic Czech or Islamic identity are dismissed while diversity and plurality within those historic taxonomies are exploited. What was the Turk? Who or what was Czech? One was as Czech as the next man (or woman). This book takes a specific focus and suggests that Czech relations with Islam and Christianity were fundamental for the development of what it meant to be Czech in the early modern world.

This is an interesting thesis and one that has not, to my knowledge, been attempted hitherto. The cultural history of Bohemia is rich and the religious fabric of the Czech world in the period just prior to Lisy-Wagner's examination was both revolutionary and at the cutting edge of European development. The book mentions religious toleration in Bohemia where it appeared (hypothetically) possible to believe whatever one wished. Another current focused on the preference for peace over doctrinal purity with the assumption that when an irenic climate prevailed, religion was purer or provided greater opportunity for rectifying confessional difference. While German and Czech cultural identities are evident, this book introduces the possibility that the Turk represented a third component in the Czech world that served to ameliorate the historic tensions between Germans and Czechs.

The emphasis on the Turk is such that Lisy-Wagner appears to adopt the view that anything negative said about Muslims is antagonistic, and she

is concerned with what she characterises as ‘anti-Ottoman propaganda’ or Islamic polemics ‘masquerading as ethnography’. One gets the sense of a pro-Islamic posture and in distinction to criticism of Muslims there is preference for the praises of Islam. This is perhaps neither here nor there except that it remains unclear if negative images of Islam have any value for the author. Limitations may be evident when a mild air of disapproval seems to settle around any negative characterisation of ‘Muslims’. While possible, it is not entirely persuasive to argue that expressions about the fear of people converting to Islam, or ‘turning Turk’, indicated an attraction to the ‘other’.

It is curious that folio numbers are never provided with references to manuscripts and sometimes journal page numbers are also omitted. One would also like to know who read the texts Lisy-Wagner utilises, especially the *ars apodemica*, and additional analyses of what impact this literature had on popular culture would be desirable. There is some unnecessary repetition, questionable value in outlining what the book intends to accomplish and finishing by summarising the same outline, and in places it reads like a PhD thesis.

The book is stimulating in many ways. For example, while the chapter on art and vases is not persuasive it is suggestive and this can be a fruitful line of inquiry for further research. Over a period of 230 years, Lisy-Wagner argues, all of the authors and artists noted in her book engaged deeply with Islam in its broadest dimension and in that engagement created Czech identity and an ideal vision of a Czech state. In this elaboration, she has forced all of us to reconsider issues of identity, travel, places, spaces, and borders in the early modern world.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *The University of New England*

**Marafioti**, Nicole, *The King's Body: Burial and Succession in Late Anglo-Saxon England* (Toronto Anglo-Saxon), Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 320; R.R.P. US\$65.00; ISBN 9781442647589.

Shortly after his accession to the English throne in 1040, the new king Harthacnut ordered the body of his predecessor and half-brother, Harold Harefoot, to be removed from its resting place at Westminster and thrown into a swamp. So much the *Anglo-Saxon Chronicle* tells us; later sources add (on what authority is unclear) that Harold's severed head was tossed into the Thames, whence it was retrieved by a fisherman's net and reburied with due honour. It is Nicole Marafioti's contention that this rather alarming example of fraternal disrespect can best be understood as part of a pattern of relationships between monarchs and the bodies of those who came before them in the later Anglo-Saxon period. Marafioti pursues a thorough, intricate, and carefully considered argument concerning the political imperatives that

surrounded the display, disappearance, or denigration of royal corpses from the death of Alfred to the Norman Conquest (899–1066).

It is a well-known contention of Norman historiography that William the Conqueror cemented the perception of his legitimacy after 1066 by stressing his familial links to Edward the Confessor while casting Harold Godwinson as an illegitimate usurper. The management of bodies was a vital aspect of this strategy, with the high altar of Battle Abbey placed on the supposed spot of Harold's battlefield demise, while William had himself crowned next to Edward's tomb at Westminster. This sequence forms the endpoint of Marafioti's study. She succeeds in showing just how closely the Conqueror's tactics with regard to the remains of his predecessors built on the political and cultural preconceptions of the Anglo-Saxon period. Rather than representing a new departure, then, early Norman practices followed earlier precedents. For example, the Danish invader Cnut had also made careful decisions about the burial arrangements for his Saxon opponent Edmund Ironside fifty years previously. It was important for purposes of Cnut's own legitimacy to afford Edmund an honourable burial, but by arranging for this to occur at Glastonbury, the Dane played his hand well. Several earlier Saxon kings had been interred there, thus marking it as a site of prestige and respect. Yet it also meant that Edmund's remains were conveniently removed to a site far distant from the rising power centre of London, thus making it less likely that his tomb would become a focal point for disaffection with the new regime. Agency lay with the living, not the dead: whatever arrangements kings may have made for their own passing and memorialisation, it was their successors who were normally able to advance their causes by the placement and treatment of earlier kings' mortal remains.

In some cases, royal fathers or brothers were memorialised in impressive shrines, such as Edward the Elder's foundation of New Minster for Alfred at Winchester, which recalled but did not completely match the commemorative or cult-like status afforded to saintly figures. Yet respect was not always so evident. Harthacnut's deliberate attempt to mark his half-brother's corpse as a 'deviant body' (p. 155), thereby delegitimising his rule, appears to have backfired by casting doubt on the new king's credibility. Marafioti argues that, in aggregate, these examples suggest an emerging respect for the office of kingship, no matter how ineffectual or unpopular the earlier incumbent may have been. In this sense, her discussion of medieval royal corpses inevitably calls to mind Ernst Kantorowicz's landmark work, *The King's Two Bodies: A Study in Mediaeval Political Theology*, originally published in 1957. Marafioti's echoing of that title can only be deliberate. Kantorowicz had stressed the dual nature of later medieval monarchy: the 'body natural' of the individual ruler died and decayed, even while his 'body politic' took its place as part of an ongoing spiritual community of rulership enhanced by the divine sanction

inherent in the royal office. The emphasis in Marafioti's work is more on the former than the latter: she persuasively shows just how important the management of royal remains became in the Anglo-Saxon world, sometimes for purposes of continuity (in an earlier period than Kantorowicz had allowed for) but also, at times, as a way to mark disruption and dynastic competition. This fine study builds on a relatively thin array of textual references along with archaeological evidence by thinking carefully and logically about the possible meanings of each monarch's fate after his death. Important decisions about royal bodies held vital implications for the political status and success of those who came after.

LINDSAY DIGGELMANN, *The University of Auckland*

**Marenbon, John**, *Abelard in Four Dimensions: A Twelfth-Century Philosopher in His Context and Ours* (Conway Lectures in Medieval Studies), Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2013; paperback; pp. 296; R.R.P. US\$34.00; ISBN 9780268035303.

Three books concerning Abelard have lately come to my hands. The volume presently under review, Babette Hellemans's (edited) *Rethinking Abelard: A Collection of Critical Essays* (Brill, 2014), and Juanita Ruys's *The Repentant Abelard: Family, Gender, and Ethics in Peter Abelard's 'Carmen ad Astralabium' and 'Planctus'* (Palgrave, 2014). Surprisingly, John Marenbon's book impressed me least of these three volumes. While Marenbon claims to have written his book 'so as to be comprehensible to readers who are approaching him [Abelard] for the first time' (p. 3), only first-time readers with very good Latin and considerable research skills would find it easily accessible. Abelard's works are not by any means all translated into English: of the thirty-four entries concerning his works in the present volume, only thirteen are in full or partial English translation, and these are usually very difficult to find. Surprisingly, the list does not include the two very revealing (and vastly more fascinating than the dry material Marenbon deals with) original works by Abelard that Ruys has brought into public ken with excellent translations, introductions, and annotations: the *Carmen* to Abelard's (and Heloise's) son, and the lovely *planctus* in which Abelard casts his 'repentance' in regard to the same Heloise. While not all were available in translation when Marenbon wrote his book, they should at least have been listed among Abelard's works. It is worth noting that David Luscombe, in his 'review' article 'Peter Abelard: Some Recent Interpretations' (*Journal of Religious History*, 7.1 (1972), pp. 69–75), starts with the *planctus* and provides overall a much shorter and more enticing introduction to the study of Abelard than the book under review here does.

*Abelard in Four Dimensions* has really been written for keen Abelard specialists. There is a reasonable life of Abelard presented in Chapter 1,

but Marenbon goes far too deeply into obscurities regarding the dating of Abelard's works and his personal disbelief in the break-through offered brilliantly in Constant Mews's *The Lost Love Letters of Heloise and Abelard* (Palgrave Macmillan, 1999) is perplexing.

The only Abelardian argument to receive any detailed treatment by Marenbon is termed 'NAG' and represents the view that 'God can do no other than he does'. This is a view few moderns would be interested in (and even contemporaries were sceptical). By p. 87, we have been taken through Abelard's argument here and the views of his opponents. Marenbon does so very competently indeed, but I am afraid that I find this territory uninteresting and out of touch with today's problems; I doubt it would tempt any person contemplating further work on Abelard to proceed.

Marenbon's 'four dimensions' seem to me to be somewhat platitudinous and they do not really succeed in taking the reader very far into the problem of dealing with past philosophers. Having offered a few such generalities, Marenbon chooses to look carefully at the relationship between Anselm and Abelard. Why pick Anselm, who, Marenbon claims, had not much influence on Abelard? Why not choose a larger figure in Abelard's development, such as, say, William of Champeaux, or even Roscelin? This chapter takes us up to Leibnitz, but only a specialist will likely be able to engage with Marenbon's speculations here, and Leibnitz seems to have got some of Abelard wrong, anyway (p. 144).

Marenbon then takes us into a learned discussion of modern writers on Abelard, who are all part of 'the re-discovery of Abelard as a philosopher that has taken place over the last forty years' (p. 146). This takes us to p. 199, after which Marenbon's Conclusion makes claims for originality and scholarly improvements in Abelardian research, which I leave to the reader to assess and judge.

While this book has been written with great competence and learning, its selection of themes and materials is odd, to say the least. There are good notes and bibliography and an index of passages in Abelard's writings.

JOHN O. WARD, *The University of Sydney*

**Martyn**, John R. C., *Letters of Pope Gregory: A Study of an Unknown Tenth-Century Manuscript Bound in Tenbury and Found in Melbourne Containing all or part of Forty Letters sent by Pope Gregory the Great*, Melbourne, Macmillan Art, 2013; hardback; pp. 184; 35 colour illustrations; R.R.P. AU\$79.95; ISBN 9781921394935.

One does not expect to find a unique early medieval manuscript stored in an unlocked filing cabinet in Australia. Yet, as John Martyn explains in his stimulating new monograph, *Letters of Pope Gregory*, this is exactly what happened to a distinctive tenth-century manuscript of forty letters written

by the late sixth-century Pope, Gregory I (c. 540–604). Purchased in 1975 from a London bookseller by the University of Melbourne for a course offered by the author, it took a long time for Martyn to realise that his copy was something special. Far more than just a translation of forty letters, this study is a product of Martyn's forty-year exploration of this fascinating text.

The Introduction offers an explanation of how this manuscript ended up in Australia and also a short summary of the complex political world of Gregory's pontificate. As Martyn points out, scholars have long mined Gregory's 854 letters for their valuable perspective on Italy during a troubled period when Byzantines, Lombards, and Italians competed for hegemony. While, granted, it was not the primary aim here to provide an in-depth account of late sixth-century Italy and the letters' author, this section would have benefited from greater interaction with recent scholarship on Gregory and his world. For example, many modern scholars would be uncomfortable with Martyn's descriptions of the Lombards as 'the Germans'.

Replete with coloured illustrations, Chapter 1 reproduces the glory of the Melbourne manuscript and the tenth-century craftsmanship behind its creation. As Martyn explains, this type of intricate illumination was rarely utilised in sets of letters, which points to the special devotion on the part of these medieval men for Gregory and his writings.

Chapter 2 offers a one-page schema of the letters. Chapter 3 provides the Latin text, followed by an English translation in the next chapter. Clearly at home within the corpus of Gregory's letters – many of which he has translated previously – Martyn transfers Gregory's often-ornate Latin into lucid English prose. Chapter 5 presents the variants. Here, Martyn uncovers the parts of the Melbourne text that support the previously accepted readings for the letters and, more importantly, the unique sections that may offer a different reading of the text. As Martyn explains, these variants will need to be consulted by any future editor hoping to produce the long-overdue update on the corpus of Gregory's letters.

Utilising more coloured illustrations, Chapter 6 analyses the illuminated capital letters scattered throughout the text. These are important because, as Martyn argues convincingly, the style and care taken by this scribe or scribes link the manuscript with two other copies of Gregory's letters that we know were created in the tenth-century Fleury *scriptorium*.

Chapter 7 offers an account of the near destruction and lucky survival of the text in the hands of a group of seventeenth-century musicians who utilised the medieval manuscripts' tough folios to protect their musical scrolls. While this service caused some damage, as Martyn argues, these men may have unwittingly assured the manuscript's ultimate survival.

Chapters 8 and 9 – to my mind misplaced at the terminus of the study – return once again to the tenth century in order to establish once and for all



that the manuscript found in Melbourne was created on the continent under the auspices of Fleury's famous preserver of ancient manuscripts and noted admirer of Gregory, the abbot Abbo (c. 945–1004). Admittedly without much tangible evidence, Martyn constructs a plausible explanation of how and why sometime in the late tenth century, a manuscript of Gregory's letters so lovingly created in Fleury-sur-Loire wound up in England.

Martyn and his publisher should be applauded for producing an affordable and visually pleasing monograph that pays homage to the 'visible artistry' of the Melbourne manuscript. One hopes that Martyn takes up his own challenge to utilise this distinctive source to create a modern critical edition of Gregory's important letters.

MICHAEL EDWARD STEWART, *Gold Coast, Queensland*

Maximos the Confessor, *On Difficulties in the Church Fathers: The Ambigua, Volume I* (Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, 28), ed. and trans. Nicholas **Constas**, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 544; R.R.P. US\$29.95, £19.95, €23.50; ISBN 9780674726666.

Maximos the Confessor, *On Difficulties in the Church Fathers: The Ambigua, Volume II* (Dumbarton Oaks Medieval Library, 29), ed. and trans. Nicholas **Constas**, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 400; R.R.P. US\$29.95, £19.95, €23.50; ISBN 9780674730830.

The Eastern Church of the seventh century reinterpreted Greek philosophy in novel ways as it dealt with various heresies and developments in theology. This is seen nowhere more clearly than in the writings of Maximos 'the Confessor', who had his tongue cut out for continuing to teach a dyothelite Christology at odds with the imperially acclaimed Monothelite position. This two-volume set by Nicholas Constas is the first English translation of some of the most important writings of Maximos. It is well presented and sure to attract attention because of the significance of the ideas discussed.

Some of Maximos's most philosophical works were written in reply to questions he received about the writings of earlier Church Fathers. His 'Ambigua' were written over a number of years in response to these questions and provide explanations of somewhat unclear wording in the writings of St Gregory the Theologian. They often use a mix of Neoplatonic, Stoic, and Aristotelian metaphysics and ethics to explain these issues which were not dry, abstract topics but central to the then-current debates on Christology. This work thus provides rich insights into how Gregory was received and reinterpreted in the context of the debates of the seventh century. It also presents the creative thinking of Maximos that in turn became foundational for Eastern theology.

Constas introduces the work of Maximos admirably, clearly explaining in his Introduction key concepts in Maximos's thought as well as the nuances of specific Greek theological terminology. His endnotes on various words and phrases are clear and relevant and are well chosen. This makes some complex ideas accessible to modern readers who are unfamiliar with Greek theological metaphysics. The translation is fresh and consistent, and is in clear English yet retaining the flavour of the original. This shows that much thought was put into this work and Constas is to be commended.

Aristotelian categories and concepts were frequent in both Gregory and Maximos's thought and this translation captures these terms and mindsets well. Gregory often discussed ideas such as monad, dyad, moved, causing to move, and so on, and Maximos explained the meaning of these clearly. He also showed how Gregory was not a cause of alarm for any seventh-century Christian who was suspicious of imported non-Christian ideas, and how a correct application of Greek philosophy created clarity in Christian theology.

Much of Gregory's work was clearly related to his times and the current theological debates and the same is true of Maximos. The Confessor shows how Gregory was answering specific issues and thus how his words should not be misunderstood. Indeed, when properly understood, the teaching of Gregory becomes relevant to seventh-century heresies. For example, Maximos's discussion of how the two natures in Christ should be contemplated is clear and relevant to current Eastern Orthodox–Oriental Orthodox debates. His explanation of when Christ should be seen as a single hypostasis or as two united natures overcomes several long-standing debated issues. Maximos creatively interpreted Gregory while remaining faithful to his position. In this he showed great intelligence yet integrity.

Not all of Maximos's comments, however, were on controversial points or on contemplative theology, as he frequently referred to ascetic practices, the virtues, and the importance of crucifying the flesh. He discussed self-mortification in relation to the theology of Christ's incarnation and avoided any dry, abstracted thought. For both Gregory and Maximos, real theology was a lived practice, and this translation brings this out consistently well.

One example is in *Ambiguum* 42, where there is an extensive consideration of how Christ assumed the pre-Fall Adamic human nature. The incarnation raised many questions for theologians, and Maximos builds on Gregory's teaching to distance Orthodoxy from various errors. Maximos shows that Christ's humanity did not suffer passion and was not liable to sin. He emphasises at the same time that Jesus was truly human and the wearer of real human flesh. His distinction between a nature subject to sin, but not dominated by it, is precise and well argued, and so it is understandable that his theology became so central to medieval Orthodox thinking.

At points, Maximos uses allegorical interpretations to explain the hidden meanings of various passages, for example, showing that something signifies reason or the passions. Yet his explanations never taught any new ideas and instead creatively used stories to point to accepted doctrines. In this, he was different from more Origenist allegorical interpreters and showed himself both practical yet traditional.

One important aspect of this translation is that it sheds further light on the early seventh-century Church's approach to Greek philosophy during the time of the beginnings of Islam. Early Islamic scholars dealt with some of the issues discussed in this work over the succeeding two centuries so these volumes provide an important source text for understanding some aspects of Al-Kindi, al-Ash'ari, and others. By the time the reader is finished with Maximos, concepts like the will, natures, species, genus, and causation will be well understood. How these metaphysical ideas were applied in the early medieval period by both Christians and Muslims is at the root of later Western philosophical development. Many ideas in Aquinas and Anselm cannot be fully appreciated without understanding this historic development.

Maximos's thought is critical in Orthodox theological development, and is again taking a prominent place especially in the light of recent Eastern Orthodox and Oriental Orthodox discussions on historic differences and possible reunion. Constan's translation and presentation of this critical text is of a very high standard and is thus timely and essential. His volumes will be of great interest to any historian of medieval theology or anyone interested in developments in Orthodox theology and possible church reunion.

JOHN D'ALTON, *Monash University*

**Monagle, Clare**, *Orthodoxy and Controversy in Twelfth-Century Religious Discourse: Peter Lombard's 'Sentences' and the Development of Theology* (Europa Sacra, 8), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xx, 194; R.R.P. €70.00; ISBN 9782503527956.

Riding on the coat-tails of Robert Moore's idea of the first European revolution, Clare Monagle drives home the important observation that medieval clerics were embedded in the cornerstone of that cultural epoch. They were the engines that produced a new world order. Crucially important was theology, that quarrelsome old woman (to borrow a phrase from Erasmus), which received a specific and striking endorsement at the Fourth Lateran Council that approved Peter Lombard. This often overlooked event constituted a watershed in the recognition of academic theology as an indispensable factor within the medieval world. The correlation between theology and heresy in the Middle Ages was alleviated to some extent when Lombard emerged from the shadows of heterodoxy into the light of official approbation. Suspicion did not vanish overnight and detractors remained convinced that Lombard's

*Sentences* did threaten ecclesiastical identity. Not even the endorsement of an ecumenical council was sufficient to establish academic theology as essential to Christian faith and institutional power. The struggle that occupied the schoolmen for two centuries indelibly marked medieval Europe. The story Monagle elaborates is one of controversy around the reception of the *Sentences* and the acrimonious struggle for the freedom of theology.

Bernard of Clairvaux was a great man, but he was also an ass. His opposition to Abelard and Gilbert of Poitiers (among others) was predicated upon the fear of questions and a commitment to maintaining simplistic faith. The critics of schoolmen between Berengar and Gilbert were motivated by fear of a heresy virus that they suspected incubated in the hothouses of questions and unrestrained thinking. Those participating in such behaviour were considered not only in error but in evil. Monagle provides vivid portraits with persuasive links to the development of theology. Christological, Eucharistic, Trinitarian, and even language issues became battlefields in the struggle for the minds of Christendom. None of this is overwrought. Roscelin of Compiègne recanted to avoid being murdered while Bernard tried to rally the faithful to cut down the 'forest of heresy' planted by the likes of Abelard and sought to convince curial officials that the latter was toxic to the faith. These were dramas on the high seas of theology and Monagle displays sound navigational skills.

Many of these theologians were (in Southern's words) 'prolix, enigmatic, strikingly original'. The schoolmen were not homogeneous but in their diversity were profoundly unified in the development of intellectual authority. The legacy of Lombard's *Sentences* was an intellectual struggle for a definitive text that flew in the face of the arrogance of orthodoxy that conceived of having built a tower of truth established for all eternity. Lombard and his successors did not imagine they were again laying foundations but they believed the past could be improved upon. The Patristics may have been authoritative, but modern problems demanded modern truths. Abelard had said much the same and fell under Bernard's withering protests that warned against the evils of theological inquiry while characterising heresy as a life or death matter. The schoolmen stood resolute and declared that ideas were transformed as that quarrelsome old woman staggered onward. The task of doing theology in the twelfth century was undertaken both with humility and confidence and the schoolmen often exhibited anguished concern over heresy while defenders of earlier traditions insisted that some theological matters were beyond investigation and ought simply to be followed, believed, and defended. Those who disagreed were dismissed as 'putrid frogs'. Monagle rightly eschews the notion of 'Lombard the bore' and lays the blame for that perception on John of Salisbury's biased account of the schools as mired in intellectual decline. No other medieval text was read more than the *Sentences* and its author was both convincing and controversial.

Monagle explicates the controversy surrounding the *Sentences* by showing that much of the criticism of Lombard was based on rumour, hearsay, and paraphrasing. Lombard's disciples, including Peter Comestor and Peter of Poitiers, introduced further controversy with their prologues, commentaries, and abbreviations. Monagle provides a marvellous survey of theological controversy in northern European schools in the twelfth and thirteen centuries. That said, I am not entirely convinced by Monagle's argument that the Lateran endorsement of Lombard was politically motivated by the ambitions of papal power and spiritual sovereignty. Does this explain the triumph of Lombard over Joachim of Fiore? Monagle concludes that in the hands of the schoolmen, that quarrelsome old woman became a 'technology of reform'. However stimulating that thought might be, her last sentence claims too much and I do not think the argument of the book completely sustains her conclusion.

Monagle's intellectual debt to Marcia Colish and Constant Mews is apparent though that does not preclude her from reading either scholar critically. This book should be read for its freshness and energy and the compelling challenge to rethink the development of medieval theology.

THOMAS A. FUDGE, *The University of New England*

**Mouron**, Anne E., ed., *The Manere of Good Lyvyng: A Middle English Translation of Pseudo-Bernard's 'Liber de modo bene vivendi ad sororem'* (Medieval Women: Texts and Contexts, 30), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 586; 1 b/w illustration; R.R.P. €110.00; ISBN 9782503545660.

The *Liber de modo bene vivendi ad sororem*, an anonymous Latin treatise from the late twelfth or early thirteenth century, is an important work of religious advice for nuns, but it has received relatively little scholarly attention. Surviving in at least nine manuscripts – Anne Mouron has unearthed some previously unknown ones – it appears to have become particularly popular in the fifteenth century, when at least five manuscript copies and a number of printed editions were made. Already in the fourteenth century, though, it was a favourite text of Birgitta of Sweden, who owned a copy that she carried around with her. She may have been responsible for making it known outside Spain, from where the earliest manuscripts come. The first English translation, the basis of the present edition, was made in the mid-fifteenth century and survives in a single manuscript (Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Laud misc. 517) that was probably made for the nuns of the Birgittine house of Syon.

Mouron brings together the history of the Latin source and its translation into English in a succinct Introduction, providing the most complete and recent summary of what is known about this text. Although the *Liber* has

long been associated with the Cistercian order, Mouron finds evidence that it was written by an Augustinian. The Introduction places the *Liber* within the tradition of religious advice to women going back to Jerome, but is less forthcoming about where it fits among twelfth- and thirteenth-century advice. There is a brief comparison with the Middle English *Ancrene Wisse*, but no reference to other Latin texts, such as the substantial *Speculum Virginum*, with which it shares some features. The Introduction also devotes some space to the translator's techniques (treated in detail by Mouron in an earlier publication), comparing them with those of three later English translators. The Middle English version emerges from this comparison as highly accomplished, remaining faithful to the sense of the Latin without slavishly following the wording.

The reader who is interested primarily in the content of the English text will find it provided in a handsome continuous layout. The reading text is followed by an extensive commentary, which occupies almost twice as many pages as the text (258 pages, while the text is 142), mostly indicating differences between the Middle English and the Latin source. In addition to providing many examples of the translator's techniques, it also identifies sources acknowledged by the Latin original and unacknowledged quotations. There are also comparisons with the later English translations.

A number of appendices enhance the usefulness of this edition. Particularly helpful in contextualising the way in which the *Manere of Good Lyvyng* was received, a transcription of the three short religious texts that accompany it in MS Laud misc. 517 is provided. Mouron outlines in the Introduction the ways in which these three texts resonate with and complement the *Manere*. Making them available also contributes to the continuing study of the circulation of short works by religious across the Channel, since from their titles at least two of them (*The Twelve Degrees of Mekenes* and *Seynt Albert the Byschop Seyth Thes Words*) may well be translations of French texts that circulated from the thirteenth century onwards. Other appendices include a glossary of Middle English, an index of proper names, and an index of biblical quotations. Together with an extensive bibliography, these tools make the edition an extremely useful reference work for students both of Middle English prose and of religious advice for women.

JANICE PINDER, *Monash University*

**Paulicelli**, Eugenia, *Writing Fashion in Early Modern Italy: From Sprezzatura to Satire* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 278; 8 colour, 48 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £65.00; ISBN 9781472411709.

Eugenia Paulicelli has pursued her interest in the history of Italian style through a series of books and edited collections that focus on fashion in Italian literature and film, addressing both the contemporary scene and earlier epochs. Her new book is a study of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century advice literature, costume books, and satirical attacks and defences of fashion.

In her opening chapter, Paulicelli revisits a topic she has previously explored with the collection *Moda e moderno: dal Medioevo al Rinascimento* (Meltemi, 2006), and similarly names this chapter '*Moda and Moderno*'. The chapter introduces themes such as discipline and imitation that will be developed in the remainder of the book. Paulicelli positions fashion as a form of discipline that superseded sumptuary legislation during the early modern period, presenting it as a relatively recent development in an ongoing civilising process that can be traced back as far as the codes of behaviour set out in monastic rules. In discussing imitation, she notes that innovations did not always spread down the social hierarchy, offering the counter-example of slashed clothes, which originated with Swiss mercenaries, later spreading to camp followers, and eventually, aristocrats.

The book is divided into three parts, with the first consisting of this initial chapter and another on Castiglione's *The Book of the Courtier*. In the second part, Paulicelli discusses the costume books of Cesare Vecellio and Giacomo Franco, devoting a chapter to each of these entrepreneurial Venetian authors and image-makers. Finally, she considers approaches to fashion in satires and anti-satires, with a chapter on the works of Archangela Tarabotti, forced to take the veil against her will, and another on those of a Benedictine monk, Agostino Lampugnani, both writers associated with the Academy of the *Incogniti* in Venice.

Paulicelli explores the way that identity politics, particularly those of gender and nation, play out in these texts, which were written in an era when the Italian peninsula was politically fragmented and often subject to foreign occupation. The texts repeatedly frame political subjugation as the consequence of an earlier sartorial submission. However, the city from which most of the texts issued, Venice, not only retained its sovereignty throughout this period, but was an important centre for both fashion and printing. Surprisingly, Paulicelli seems to ignore this, along with the enormous influence that Italian culture had in seventeenth-century France, as she laments that nation's success in snatching the crown of fashion from Italy.

The historical emergence of fashion, in the sense that we now know it, constitutes the chief concern of the book. Paulicelli begins with



'[t]he etymological trajectories of both *la moda* and fashion' (p. 5), and their cognates in other European languages. She supplements this, in the second part of the book, with a fascinating discussion of framing, distortion, and mirroring, applied particularly to the images in the costume books. Finally, she identifies a key development in mid-seventeenth-century Italy, the advent of the *modanti* or *foggiani*, groups labelled using 'neologisms ... difficult to render into English: "fashionistas" or "fashion victims" do not completely render the nuances' (p. 209). Paulicelli contends that writings can teach new ways of seeing the world, arguing for 'the potential of words and language to exceed and transform the world, now seen through a new lens: fashion' (p. 221).

The book as a whole is aimed at a specialist, academic audience. It studies fashion as a mentality, paying relatively little attention to specific styles, and assumes a general knowledge of the broad developments in the early modern Italian and European fashion and textile trades. Its opening chapter provides an introduction to fashion in early modern Italy, helpfully integrating the English and Italian historiography on this topic. The book also serves to draw attention, in the context of English-language discussions of European fashion, to the importance of the as-yet-untranslated texts discussed in the last part of the book.

TRACEY GRIFFITHS, *The University of Melbourne*

**Pericolo**, Lorenzo, and David M. **Stone**, eds, *Caravaggio: Reflections and Refractions* (Visual Culture in Early Modernity), Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 392; 5 colour, 109 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £75.00; ISBN 9781409406846.

Michelangelo Merisi de Caravaggio was one of the most enigmatic and seemingly contradictory figures in art history. His sublime images took on religious topics towards the end of his life that appeared to be at odds with his naturalistic style, antisocial behaviour, and violent demise. This has led to many apocryphal, trivial, and rehashed studies of Caravaggio. Editors Lorenzo Pericolo and David M. Stone ask 'why write another book on Caravaggio?' Their answer: to improve the scholarship on this great Renaissance artist. *Caravaggio: Reflections and Refractions* originated from an organised panel on Caravaggio for the Renaissance Society of America in 2009. The book consists of fourteen essays that holistically create a new in-depth study of Caravaggio, his work, his followers, and his place in art history.

Attribution of Caravaggio's work has been problematic and in the 1980s many mediocre works were attributed to him, often from minor technical evidence such as visible incisions in the canvas. Stone's essay considers the important problem of connoisseurship. Throughout the world, exhibitions and collections of paintings have been attributed to Caravaggio that he most

certainly did not paint. Stone points to the importance of connoisseurship since 'we risk losing the painter we supposedly cherish if specialists failed to voice their opinions and challenge attributions' (p. 26). This highlights the importance of reanalysing Caravaggio's techniques. Larry Keith's essay demonstrates how Caravaggio continually changed his techniques and styles to suit the subject of the image. This reveals that it is imperative to expand the concept of Caravaggio's technique beyond pigment and layer structures in evaluating his work. Keith Christiansen expands on Caravaggio's techniques and demonstrates that our concepts of the master painter's far-from-uniform style have continued to change as scholarship, particularly in regard to his techniques, has advanced.

Erin E. Benay examines Caravaggio's *Doubting Thomas*. Painted in 1602, it was a relatively uncommon topic in Roman art and one that was vilified by John Calvin who claimed that the stupidity of Thomas was astonishing and monstrous. However, Catholic reformers saw Thomas's action in a different light. The painting was commissioned by Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani who, Benay claims, sought new ways of engaging with the divine. She believes that Caravaggio's unconventional painting reflects the religious practices of both the Roman cult of St Thomas and the relic of the Holy Shroud that infused a rich spiritual meaning into his painting.

Francis Gage also believes that Caravaggio was deeply influenced by a contemporary mysticism, but claims that Caravaggio's scandalous *Death of the Virgin* was symptomatic of his style. He reputedly used a prostitute for the model of the Virgin, a fact he did not attempt to disguise. This highly inappropriate representation of the sacred raises questions about Caravaggio's religion, leaving it open to debate despite his increasing number of religious paintings at the end of his life.

Catherine Puglisi discusses Caravaggio's visualisation of music: 'Caravaggio's talking pictures pushed the bounds of the mute art of painting, like the word pictures in poetry or the tone poem in music' (p. 118). Steven F. Ostrow considers the earthly and naturalistic qualities of Caravaggio's Angels that are conceived as liminal creatures caught between the sacred and the profane. This combination of visually naturalistic, the structural components of his religious narratives, and their incompatibility in Caravaggio's paintings is further discussed by Jonathan Unglaub. These contradictory and incompatible elements are highlighted by Philip Sohm's examination of Caravaggio as anti-Michelangelo and the Antichrist. Caravaggio attempted to emulate Michelangelo's reported eccentric and unconventional personality; however, by doing so he may have coincidentally assisted in establishing Michelangelo's reputation as a 'barbarian'.

Next, the followers of Caravaggio are considered. Richard Spear demonstrates that Caravaggio's work was in limited supply and obtained

high prices, but his followers' works were numerous and they were, in comparison, poorly compensated for them; by 1630, market forces resulted in a decline in interest and production of Caravaggesque painting in Rome. Gail Feigenbaum considers the ways that Caravaggio's later followers, such as Rembrandt, emulated Caravaggio's theme of deception in their paintings. Whether or not Rembrandt set out to emulate Caravaggio is another question. H. Perry Chapman considers the critical responses to Rembrandt's work to be remarkably similar to those of Caravaggio's.

The naturalism of Caravaggio's paintings is a theme throughout the book. Elizabeth Cropper examines Caravaggio's naturalistic approach in relation to the rise of the new sciences and scientists, in particular Galileo. She considers the possibility that the new naturalistic science mirrored contemporaneous developments in painting. The final essay by Pericole turns to twentieth-century commentaries on Caravaggio's naturalism and conflicting arguments as to whether there is any connection between his works and Galileo's new naturalistic science of nature. He concludes that Caravaggio's paintings and their 'reception transcend and even elide culture in order to tap into the innermost foundations of humankind' (p. 316).

Although each essay could be read as a stand-alone chapter, the arrangement of the essays creates cohesive narrative that is interesting and highly scholarly. The tension and often inappropriateness between Caravaggio's naturalism and his religious topics is highlighted throughout, and even though Caravaggio remains an enigma, he is now certainly less elusive.

TESSA MORRISON, *The University of Newcastle*

**Pons-Sanz, Sara M.**, *The Lexical Effects of Anglo-Scandinavian Linguistic Contact on Old English* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 1), Turnhout, Brepols, 2013; hardback; pp. xv, 589; R.R.P. €125.00; ISBN 9782503534718.

John Donne's dictum 'doubt wisely' (*Satire* 3, line 77) comes to mind when reading this book, which now takes its place as the standard and authoritative reference-work on the lexical effects of Scandinavian settlement in England from the ninth to the eleventh centuries. Sara Pons-Sanz builds on her series of earlier publications, including two monographs, *Analysis of the Scandinavian Loanwords in the Aldredian Glosses to the Lindisfarne Gospels* (Universitat de València, 2000) and *Norse-Derived Vocabulary in Late Old English Texts: Wulfstan's Works, a Case Study* (John Benjamins, 2007), in a work of fresh and insightful analysis, and rigorous critique of received views on the canon of Norse-derived loans.

Following the introductory and methodological discussion of Chapter 1, the book is divided into three parts. The first (Chapter 2) discusses the etymology and phonological/morphological form of each lexeme, and has as

its companion Appendix III, listing words which formerly have been advanced as loan words, but which are rejected and re-categorised as 'native'. Even those words that are counted as loans are often admitted only with qualification, and on a basis of probability following nuanced and complex argument. The evidence for Norse origin is frequently weighed against hypotheses that the form of a word may be explained alternatively as of native Old English origin on the basis of related words in the language, or cognates in the other West Germanic dialects. The evidence of dialectal and chronological distribution is also put into the equation. Even with some of the most commonly adduced and widely accepted loans, Pons-Sanz applies her 'particularly sceptical view' (p. 28) and plays Devil's advocate. OE *lagu* 'law', for example, is ultimately accepted as Norse-derived, but only after the author has laid out the evidence of related nouns in OE such as *feorlegu* and *orlæg*, and cognates like Old High German *urlag* and Old Saxon *orlag* that leave at least a small possibility that we are dealing with a semantic loan rather than a loan-word, or with a fully native term. Stronger doubts are expressed about an item like OE *cnif* 'knife', although it is ultimately allowed into the corpus of 179 words and seven phrases. Some 145 items in Appendix III fail to make the cut.

Building on this rigorously selected corpus of words, Chapter 3 examines them from a lexico-semantic perspective, first examining their dialectal and chronological distribution, set out with splendid clarity in a series of tables based on chronological banding, and the location of texts within or outside Scandinavianised areas. Words are then sorted into their semantic fields, using a system of classification based on the *Thesaurus of Old English*, and examined in relation to their native OE synonyms. Thus, Pons-Sanz is able to provide 'snapshots of the different stages of the terms' integration into Old English' (p. 242). One of the most interesting and complex cases is that of *lagu*, which moves from being a culturally marked 'peripheral' term in the field, to becoming the 'core' member, with the concomitant decline of native terms such as OE *riht* and, in the religious field, *æ* and *bebod*.

Chapter 4 examines Norse-derived terms in a set of selected texts, offered as case studies, and providing a model for further work of this kind. New insights into the relationship of the D- and E-recensions of the *Chronicle* entries from 1064 to 1080 are provided, for example. Pons-Sanz examines the apparent retention from the exemplar of Norse-derived words in the Worcester version, where they are replaced by native items in the Peterborough version. The case studies also cover Ælfric, Aldred's and Owun's glosses to the Lindisfarne and Rushworth Gospels, *The Battle of Maldon*, and the *Lives of St Nicholas* and *St Giles*. Finally, the author explores lexical evidence to consider whether the glosses to the Lindisfarne Gospels and the Durham Ritual are by the same Aldred, and whether the whole of the *Chronicle of Æthelred and Cnut* should be attributed to a single person.

Pons-Sanz has provided a work that is theoretically well informed and meticulously detailed in its presentation of the linguistic, historical, and textual complexities that require discussion. It will remain the standard work on the subject for many years to come, but also lights the way for further cultural and textual analysis building upon her firm foundations.

GREG WAITE, *The University of Otago*

**Roest, Bert**, *Order and Disorder: The Poor Clares between Foundation and Reform* (Medieval Franciscans, 8), Leiden, Brill, 2013; hardback; pp. 480; R.R.P. €164.00, US\$228.00; ISBN 9789004243637.

To write the history of an enclosed, contemplative women's order, one that set no great store in chronicling or scholarship and whose monasteries were largely autonomous, is indeed a daunting undertaking. In the case of Franciscan women, the so-called Second Order, those challenges multiply when one considers the geographical spread of their houses, the diversity of languages, and the sheer number of houses established during the Order's first three and a half centuries. Added to all this is the further complication that there were several Rules, none was universally observed, and all admitted, to a greater or lesser degree, of 'customisations' which accommodated *forma vitae* to the needs and preferences of individual houses and their patrons.

Chapters 1 and 2 of Bert Roest's splendid monograph cover the origins and development of the Order set against the backdrop of the Fourth Lateran Council and papal efforts to impose order on the rapidly expanding women's penitential movement. The perspective taken on Clare of Assisi's role and influence reflects recent scholarship: a determined personality, to be sure, but not the founder-of-an-order, correlate of St Francis portrayed in hagiography. Her personal Rule (1253), for example, for which she fought so tenaciously was approved only for a handful of other houses, whereas the Rule of Isabelle of France (1259/63), sister of King Louis IX, which established the Order of Enclosed Sisters Minor, enjoyed far wider reach in Europe and across the Channel. Apostolic poverty, so central to Clare's Franciscan charism, does not figure in the Rules of 1219 and 1247, nor in Urban IV's Rule of 1263, which formally established the Order of St Clare and proved to be the Clarisses' most widely observed Rule. The complexities and realpolitik of *cura monialium*, the issue that vexed the relationship between the friars and the female followers of St Francis for almost a century, are deftly handled and presented with exemplary clarity.

The period of expansion and reform – covered in Chapters 3 and 4 – poses the greatest challenge by dint of the fragmentary nature of the historical record and the difficulty (often impossibility) of verifying much of the data. Muddying the waters further is the phenomenon of order shifting: 'Houses listed as Poor Clare monasteries at one time could be recognised as houses

of tertiaries, Augustinian canonesses, or Benedictine nuns at another.' Roest proceeds by way of geographical area providing vignettes of individual houses and highlighting their individuality and their commonalities. What emerges is a composite, richly variegated picture of a dynamic, loosely organised movement in the process of institutional growth and spiritual renewal. Most influential of the reforms was that instigated by Colette. It gave new life to the spirit of Clare's Rule and served to align Colettine houses with the Observant branch of the Franciscans then in the ascendancy. Particularly valuable is the summary of typologies provided at the end of Chapter 3. It is a pity the maps appended to that chapter are so lacking in clarity.

The last two chapters deal with Clarissan life *intra muros*, the position of abbess, the novitiate, and general organisation, along with the modes of literary and artistic expression that were available to the nuns.

There have been a number of earlier attempts to provide an overview of the Second Order of St Francis. None comes near the intellectual embrace, the impressive synthesis, and command of detail that is Roest's formidable achievement. He has crafted a coherent account from a welter of disparate sources, and his judgements are informed by decades of extensive reading in more than half a dozen languages (the bibliography alone runs to fifty-four pages). John Moorman's *A History of the Franciscan Order* (1968) devoted just four of its forty-three chapters to Franciscan women. Roest has provided its indispensable companion.

ROBERT CURRY, *The University of Sydney*

**Ross**, Elizabeth, *Picturing Experience in the Early Printed Book: Breydenbach's 'Peregrinatio' from Venice to Jerusalem*, University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2014; hardback; pp. 256; 27 colour, 84 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$79.95; ISBN 9780271061221.

In her richly illustrated new book, Elizabeth Ross conducts a thorough, multifocal investigation into Bernard von Breydenbach's *Peregrinatio in terram sanctum* ('Journey to the Holy Land'). Breydenbach was a well-connected cleric from Mainz who took the unprecedented step of including an artist in his team for a pilgrimage to the Holy Land in 1483. Northern artist, Erhart Reuwich, was employed to create visuals to accompany Breydenbach's written account of the journey, which according to Ross, resulted in re-conceptualising the book. The travelogue was first published in Latin in 1486 and was subsequently published in several European languages in the following decades.

Ross investigates the historical milieu that motivated Breydenbach to undertake the project, while considering the role of cultural influences on both author and artist that, in combination with their own creative and technical innovations, brought the work to fruition in the context of the newly emergent

print culture. Ross argues that author and artist collaborated diligently and deliberately to create an innovative work that would be deemed credible by the intended audience. They achieved this by re-conceptualising the book as a 'multi-media bricolage' (p. 18), and implementing the 'eyewitness account' and the newly emergent visual genre of the 'view', as proof of their empirical experience of the Levant and Holy Land. Concomitantly, they constructed the scaffolding to make their respective accounts 'truth'.

Ross emphasises the fundamental role of the print medium in enabling the experimental manipulation of text sources and visuals by the creators, and in facilitating the broad dissemination of an authoritative and convincing spiritual and temporal message against heresy. This message was aimed at a European Christian audience fearful of the westward expansion of the Muslim Ottoman Empire. As Breydenbach states, his book was intended as a practical guide to pilgrimage but more importantly, it was constructed to arouse crusader spirit in the West and ultimately return the Holy Land to Christendom.

The book is divided into five chapters and includes notes on editions and folio numbers, 111 illustrations, and a gatefold map, as well as a bibliography that contains useful references for incunabula and modern editions of primary sources. Ross begins her book by introducing Breydenbach, his team, and the details of their journey. A thorough visual analysis of the *Peregrinatio's* decorative frontispiece demonstrates the makers' appropriation and amalgamation of historical sources. The image exemplifies the role symbolism played in announcing the authority of author and artist to the early modern reader, which served to validate the content that followed.

Chapter 2 further examines the concept of authority in the work and the way in which artist and author utilised diverse contemporary and historical factors to advantage. These include Breydenbach's exploitation of the 1485 Censorship Edict issued by the Archbishop of Mainz, and Reuwich's use of the relatively novel 'view' genre in art, which worked to give authority to their respective 'eyewitness' accounts. In Chapter 3, Ross considers Breydenbach and Reuwich's approach to the challenge of 'difference' in relation to Islam and other Mediterranean heresies. The pilgrims spent a month in Venice preparing for their departure, picking up rhetorical devices and artistic influences from the Venetians that infiltrate the travelogue. To further validate their cause, Ross claims, Breydenbach and Reuwich deliberately portrayed Venice as the last bastion of true religion in an eastward journey that culminated in the Holy Land, itself conversely represented as a hotbed of heresy.

The remaining chapters are devoted to in-depth visual analyses of Reuwich's *Map of the Holy Land with View of Jerusalem*. The fourth chapter concentrates on investigating the way in which Reuwich critically collated and amalgamated numerous cartographic and textual sources in constructing the



map. In combination with empirical experience and Northern traditions of spatial representation in painting, the artist produced a visual representation of the Holy Land, convincingly observed from a single viewpoint. The final chapter provides a sharply focused study of the topographical and architectural aspects depicted in Reuwich's *View of Jerusalem*, which is situated within the larger map. Ross explores the way the Christian practice of earning indulgences through 'viewing' impacted Reuwich's construction of the built environment, which in turn gave Christians an awareness of their loss and, conversely, a degree of control over a city otherwise dominated by an Islamicised built environment.

The persistence of scholarship on aspects of cross-cultural encounters between Christian Europe and the Muslim East in the medieval and early modern period is testament to an ongoing interest in the multifarious ways in which Europeans engaged with, represented, and perceived their eastern counterparts. Ross makes a valuable contribution to scholarship in the field and concurrently to our understanding of authority and representation in early printed works.

AMANDA VAN DER DRIFT, *The University of Queensland*

**Schieberle**, Misty, *Feminized Counsel and the Literature of Advice in England, 1380–1500* (Disputatio, 26), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 224; R.R.P. €75.00; ISBN 9782503550121.

Misty Schieberle's study of feminised counsel – a term denoting 'the advice associated with and spoken by women characters' – is published as part of Brepols' 'Disputatio' series. It sits nicely alongside other publications in the series, for the way it engages in a close study of medieval texts and ideas and the reception of these texts.

Schieberle focuses on late medieval texts that draw on the mirrors for princes genre, arguing that 'far from using women's voices as an "opposite" against which to define masculine aristocratic authority, late medieval poets concerned with ethical kingship embraced the feminine as a representation of their own subordination to kings, patrons, and authorities: they developed authority by identifying with their women counsellors' (p. 17). Schieberle asserts that this strategy ensured these women were written into positions of authority as political counsellors, a practice which subsequently achieved authority for the poets. It is a persuasive and ultimately successful argument. Her survey – spanning Gower's *Confessio Amantis*, Chaucer's *Legend of Good Women* and *Melibee*, to English translations of Christine de Pisan's *Epistre Othea* – considers the variety of ways in which female characters offered advice and shows how women could be represented in ways which run contrary to antifeminist assumptions.

Embedded in Schieberle's analysis is an awareness of shifting cultural understandings of fortune, as represented in the mirrors for princes genre, and the importance of practising virtue in order to halt the turn of Fortune's wheel. The way in which Schieberle extends Paul Strohm's research in this area is quite exciting.

The book is divided into four chapters, each focusing upon a particular text. Schieberle's examples are vernacular translations of Latin and French sources, a shift in language which is understood as compounding the poets' need to generate authority. As the chapters progress, Schieberle establishes the connection between the women counsellors of these texts and the historical context and, while all four chapters acknowledge the politics of the period, the final two chapters were the strongest in this respect.

Chapter 1, focusing on marriage metaphors in Gower's *Confessio Amantis*, provides a solid background to the study. The chapter includes a discussion of Giles of Rome's *De Regimine Principum*, in which Schieberle outlines Giles's antifeminist views and notes his representation of the parallels between the realm and the household. Schieberle suggests this provided a starting place for poets, such as Gower, to use marriage to discuss counsel.

The following two chapters firmly establish Chaucer's work as central to Schieberle's argument. Drawing on well-chosen examples, Schieberle teases out, among other topics, the distinction between intercession and feminised counsel. An important thread introduced in the second chapter and picked up in relation to Chaucer's *Melibee*, is the 'distinction between the universal and the particular and its impact on both gender and political advice' as 'topics of interest for Chaucer' (p. 92). The close manuscript study at the end of the third chapter is also a notable highlight.

The final chapter, which considers the identification with women of male translators, focusing on the *Epistre Othea* in Middle English, is the most exciting in its originality, its contribution to Schieberle's overall argument, and the potential it offers for further research. This chapter covers a great deal, moving from Christine de Pizan's *Epistre Othea*, to the translation by Stephen Scrope (c. 1440), and the anonymous producer of the *Lytil Bibell of Knyghtod*. These translations confront the gendered tensions that could appear when a female character was given a voice of authority, and the different ways a male poet could deal with these tensions. Schieberle writes with confidence about the *Bibell*, and unsurprisingly she notes her ongoing research for a new critical edition of the *Bibell* (p. 171). It will be a welcome contribution to the field.

Overall, Schieberle makes a compelling argument for the role of femininity in establishing authority, and the ways that female counsellors could advise for the betterment of individual and realm. Her analysis stresses the performativity and flexibility of gender and authority, while highlighting

the identification between the poets and their characters. Comparison is facilitated by the use of original text accompanied by translations, an editorial decision which also widens accessibility of the book across disciplines. I would recommend this book to those interested in women's and gender studies, cultural studies, medieval literature, and medieval history.

SALLY FISHER, *Monash University*

**Spyra**, Piotr, *The Epistemological Perspective of the Pearl-Poet*, Farnham, Ashgate, 2014; hardback; pp. 184; 10 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £60.00; ISBN 9781472430823.

Steeped in an understanding of Augustinian epistemology, Piotr Spyra presents the four poems of the BL, Cotton Nero manuscript – *Cleanness*, *Patience*, *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, and *Pearl* – as dedicated to exploring the limitations of human understanding, and to communicating the ‘great gulf’ that lies between heaven and earth (p. 31). Spyra’s analysis emphasises the relevance of the Neoplatonic basis underlying Augustinian sign-theory to understanding the Pearl-Poet’s attitude towards language, and the literary techniques he employs.

Spyra’s book is divided into three chapters, with a substantial Introduction providing background information about the manuscript and a review of previous approaches to interpreting the texts. The first chapter focuses on links between the content of the poems and the larger theological concerns of the period, such as the issue of God’s foreknowledge and human free will, and the limitations neo-Aristotelian epistemology cast upon humankind’s ability to transcend knowledge of the natural world and reach an understanding of the Divine. Spyra seems to be suggesting that the Scholastic distinction between the two powers in God – *potentia absoluta* and *potentia ordinata* – dominates, to a large extent, the way the Pearl-Poet organises the content of his poems. This is illustrated in the manner that the texts emphasise the nature of God’s involvement in the affairs of the world (seen in *Cleanness* and *Patience*) and humankind’s failure to reach beyond human terms and understandings to conceptualise God (as in the Pearl-Dreamer’s inability to accept the divine logic described to him by the Pearl-maiden, and Jonah’s persistence in attributing to God human sense capacities). Also in this chapter, Spyra discusses the problems of interpreting signs within the narrative, focusing on the inability to interpret successfully the meaning of objects in *Sir Gawain*, and the complications involved in interpreting the meaning of words in *Pearl*.

In the second chapter – just half the size of the first – Spyra attends to the patterns and symmetries found in the structure of the texts themselves, examining parallels between the texts and transitions bridging the texts. Arguing that the ordering in the manuscript provides one of the most important keys to interpretation by highlighting the progress of

providential history and the role of divine illumination, Spyra encourages the critic to consider the four poems as a complete set. The importance of divine illumination is central to Spyra's arguments in the second half of this chapter, in which he compares the narrative progress and thematic concerns of the Cotton Nero manuscript with those of Augustine's *De Magistro*. He then moves on to discuss the doubleness of meaning of words, suggesting that it is 'the duality of meaning that characterises the interplay between the finite and the infinite' (p. 113). The double meaning of words is anchored in the Platonic distinction between the realm of ideal forms and the earthly world of imperfect copies. Words such as 'trawth' or 'cleanness' have two meanings: one when they are predicated on the Divine, and another when their signification is related to temporal phenomena.

Briefer yet than the second, the final chapter argues that the Pearl-Poet's epistemological concern with the unbridgeable gap between divine knowledge and human understanding underlies his obsession with detailed descriptions. While acknowledging accuracy in meaning can never be reached and ignorance might never be fully overcome, it is vital that the poet and humankind persist in trying to come closer to an accurate understanding. According to Spyra, the ultimate message of the Pearl-Poet's epistemological vision is a 'call to action' based on the belief that God may grant his Grace to one who keeps on trying and never gives up.

The significant contribution of Spyra's work is his demonstration that it is possible to link the technical philosophical and theological discussions of the Scholastics with the themes of the poems, while at the same time showing how the patterning and ordering of the texts perform the didactic function of conveying the theological messages to the audience via the process of reading or listening.

While Spyra has convincingly established links between the epistemology of the Pearl-Poet and the Neoplatonic nature of St Augustine's sign-theory, he has also drawn some compelling parallels between the design and thematic content of the Cotton Nero manuscript and the interests and concerns of theologians, such as Ockham, Wodeham, and Holcot, closer in time to the Pearl-Poet. In doing so, Spyra creates space for future investigations into whether the less-Augustinian epistemologies of fourteenth-century philosophers might contribute to the understanding of the Cotton Nero texts.

C. K. Y. SAVILLE, *The University of Auckland*

**Tinti**, Francesca, ed., *England and Rome in the Early Middle Ages: Pilgrimage, Art, and Politics* (Studies in the Early Middle Ages, 40), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. x, 381; 7 b/w illustrations, 2 maps, 3 tables; R.R.P. €90.00; ISBN 9782503541693.

All roads lead to Rome, and indeed Nicholas Howe, in his *Writing the Map of Anglo-Saxon England* (Yale University Press, 2008), argued for Rome as ‘capital of Anglo-Saxon England’. The connections between Rome and England have long been the subject of research, but, as this book demonstrates, the field is ripe for ongoing investigation, both to incorporate new archaeological findings and to revisit and refine our readings of the documentary evidence.

Francesca Tinti’s Introduction provides a brief survey of work in the field since Wilhelm Levison’s *England and the Continent in the Eighth Century* (Clarendon Press, 1946). As Tinti concludes from her summation of the eleven chapters that follow, Rome was a site of authority and pilgrimage for the Anglo-Saxons from the time of the Conversion through to the eleventh century, and the number of visitors who came from England was sustained and substantial. Some essays overlap and usefully interlock, but the breadth of topics and disciplinary approaches is impressive, and the essays strike a very good balance between providing a historical and bibliographical survey of their topics along with presentation of new research findings, and suggestions for further lines of enquiry.

David Pelteret opens with a study of the various routes to Rome. Heading his chapter ‘Not All Roads Lead to Rome’, he explores the points beyond those to which Anglo-Saxons sometimes travelled, particularly Gargano on the Adriatic coast. This pilgrimage site is further considered in the essay by Lucia Sinisi, who examines the cult of the Archangel Michael originating there, which spread to England. The next two essays focus on the experiences of pilgrims to Rome. Riccardo Santangeli Valenzani examines the *xenodochia* or hostels for visitors, the rise of the *scholae peregrinorum*, and in particular the famous *schola Saxonum*, under papal strategies to strengthen ties with the populations of northern Europe. Alan Thacker discusses the monuments and cult sites of Rome, both intramural and extramural, and the role of the papacy in the process of renovation and provision of access for pilgrims in the seventh century, as well as the influx of elite English pilgrims in the latter half of the century. Luisa Izzi focuses on the visits of the English to the catacombs, the evidence they left behind in the forms of inscriptions and graffiti, and the influences on art, architecture, and liturgy they carried back to England. Veronica Ortenberg West-Harling looks at two of the most influential sites that the English visited, and from which they took back artistic and liturgical innovations: the chapel of John VII in the Vatican basilica, and the chapel of St Laurence in the Lateran palace. The former was perhaps the site most likely

to have inspired English iconographical traditions such, as the robed Christ of the crucifixion.

Rory Naismith provides an important catalogue and analysis of Anglo-Saxon coin finds in Rome, along with an examination of the influence of Roman coinage in England, particularly the archiepiscopal coinage of Canterbury, beginning with a silver penny of Wulfred from the early ninth century.

The political dimension of the book comes to the fore in the next two essays. Marios Costambeys provides a finely nuanced essay on the uneasiness of Alcuin and other advisors to Charlemagne over the reign and policies of Pope Leo III, the question of authority in Rome, and in particular the *causa sancti Pauli*, the project to renovate or build a Frankish monastery adjacent to the papal basilica of St Paul. Thomas Noble examines the rise and fall of the archbishopric of Lichfield, established informally the year after the 786 papal mission to England instigated by Hadrian, and though legitimated in due course, suppressed by Leo III in 802. Tinti herself writes on the archiepiscopal pallium, and the complex ideological and political circumstances of the tenth and eleventh centuries connected with the high number of archbishops of Canterbury who travelled to Rome to receive their pallium in person, in striking contrast with the archbishops of York who did not. The volume concludes with Elaine Treharne's essay structured around literary portrayals of the piety of Cnut during and after his visit to Rome in 1027, beginning with Sigvatr Þórðarsons's skaldic poem *Knútsdrápa* and ending with William Slatyer's sonnet on 'Canute' in *The History of Great Britanie* (1621). Cnut's attendance on Conrad at the latter's coronation in Rome marked the beginning of a sustained campaign of propaganda to project his own imperial status and his role as pious *vicarius Christi*.

Under the meticulous editorial hand of Francesca Tinti, from Introduction through to Index, this volume emerges as a major contribution to the study of relations between Anglo-Saxon England and Rome. Its strengths lie in its setting out of summative discussions combined with accounts of productive new lines of research in progress.

GREG WAITE, *The University of Otago*

**Trigg**, Stephanie, *Shame and Honor: A Vulgar History of the Order of the Garter*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012; cloth; pp. 322; 30 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$55.00; ISBN 9780812243918.

Neither cover, nor title, tells the full story of this fascinating book by Stephanie Trigg, but both suggest much of what it contains. The cover – a splendid painting by Rex Whistler entitled 'Allegory: HRH the Prince Regent awakening the Spirit of Brighton', in which the prince, naked apart from the insignia of the Garter, impends over a nude woman – offers an

image of the 'shame' of the title but little of its 'honor'. Deeply suggestive (in more than one sense), it alludes, by associating the Garter with sexuality, to one of the book's prominent themes. While the title redresses the balance by its inclusion of 'honor', it notably places it second, reflecting some of the implications of the subtitle. This is a 'vulgar' history in more than one sense as Trigg herself explains: 'First, it ... moves between historical and thematic approaches, bypassing the commemorative impulses of official histories ... Second [it] returns repeatedly to the myth of the woman's dropped garter, so often dismissed as a "vulgar" invention' (p. 15).

While the first of these interpretations might not immediately occur to the reader, the choice of the word 'vulgar', rather than the traditional 'popular', is apt. This is not a 'popular history', a history written for popular consumption, but instead takes a 'vulgar' view of the Garter rather than one devoted to exalting and honouring the order. A vulgar view is not necessarily a negative view – it can be one that appreciates the honour inherent in the Garter – but it will not only see honour in the Order's history. It is also one that can embrace the implications of sexual impropriety in the myth of the Garter's origins. Trigg points out that the historical origins of the Order are hidden in obscurity but notes that: 'The story of a medieval royal scandal about sex and underclothes has often been dismissed as a fantastic or romantic invention, but it has nevertheless given rise to a long and beloved tradition' (p. 5).

It is this tradition and the significance of its continuing popularity – its vulgar appeal – that particularly interests her. Furthermore, she claims that 'while the uncertainty about the Order's origins may seem a simple matter of lost or missing evidence, we may still acknowledge that the uncertainty ... might actually be integral to the mythic structure and resonance of the Order' (p. 50). A substantial part of the book is consequently devoted to an examination of the myth and the associated 'enigmatic' (p. 5) motto ('*Honi soit qui mal y pense*'). Trigg is well placed to tease out the significance of all this and these sections of the book contain some of her most characteristically subtle and perceptive writing. While the book's countering of a purely honorific history of the Garter is primarily through the 'vulgar' perspective, it also offers two specific counter-narratives, one covering the periods of neglect which the Order has suffered and another detailing how women, after occupying an important role in the order in earlier centuries, played no part for 400 years until Edward VII made Queen Alexandra a 'Lady' of the order despite the determined opposition of the Garter King of Arms. On the other hand, the present queen's extension of membership to non-royal women excited no comment, demonstrating a constant theme of the book, the order's capacity and (occasional) willingness to adapt to modern attitudes despite its medieval (or medievalist) trappings.



One thing not hinted at in the title is nevertheless a key aspect of the book: Trigg's concern with the Garter as an example of both the medieval and medievalism. As she explains, 'to contemplate the ongoing life of the medieval into modernity and postmodernity ... remains the ultimate aim of this book' (p. 15) and 'it is precisely because this Order ... has had to make so many accommodations with its medieval origins that it poses such an intriguing set of questions and problems about the afterlife of the medieval in postmedieval culture' (p. 6). The insights offered throughout the book amply demonstrate the truth of this assertion. To give just one example, Trigg shows how the differing reactions of Garter historians and the general public to the Garter myth relate to the opposition, set up in the Renaissance, between the Middle Ages as a feminine world of fantasy and romance and the modern world as an age of reason.

At the end, after a chapter dealing with today's manifestations of the Garter, Trigg asks 'Why does the modern and contemporary history of the Garter read like a series of weird examples, fragments, and half-understood allusions?' (p. 271). The question modestly ignores the skill with which she has, throughout the book, put together a coherent narrative, impossible to describe here in all its subtlety and complexity, which makes sense of all the strangeness of the modern Garter and provides in the process a thoughtful and provocative alternative account of this enduring and intriguing institution.

GRAHAM TULLOCH, *Flinders University*

**Uhlig**, Marion, and Yasmina **Foeher-Janssens**, eds, *D'Orient en Occident: Les recueils de fables enchâssées avant les 'Mille et une Nuits' de Galland (Barlaam et Josaphat, Calila et Dimna, Disciplina clericalis, Roman des Sept Sages)* (Cultural Encounters in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages, 16), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; hardback; pp. xi, 496; 2 colour, 20 b/w illustrations, 3 b/w tables; R.R.P. €110.00; ISBN 9782503546872.

This book contains a valuable collection of scholarly articles, and will be quite indispensable in its area. It is the outcome of an international conference at the University of Geneva in 2010 concerned with medieval *fables enchâssées*, collections of stories within a framing story. It looks back occasionally to the origins of the genre in pre-medieval times, and looks ahead to Antoine Galland's compilation of the *Mille et une Nuits* between 1704 and 1717, its chronological limit. Oriental framework collections were among the most widely read books in the Middle Ages, and were frequently translated into other languages. *D'Orient en Occident* is especially concerned with the transmission of *fables enchâssées* from the East to the West. The four framework collections that the book focuses on are *Barlaam et Josaphat*, *Calila et Dimna*, *Disciplina Clericalis*, and *Le Roman des Sept Sages*.

The book comes from a project initially proposed by Marion Uhlig, who edits the collection in conjunction with colleague Yasmine Foehr-Janssens. They collaborated also on the Introduction. The editing is careful, even painstaking, but the Introduction, whether in French or its accompanying English translation, is written in an obscure style heavy with abstract nouns, adjectives, and verbs, making it somewhat difficult to read and understand.

There are twenty-one essays in the collection, two-thirds of them in French, the others in English (four), Spanish (two), and German (one), the last a particularly attractive contribution by Constanza Cordoni. After scholarly research into the origins of the story of Barlaam and Josaphat, Cordoni humanely acknowledges that it is in any case an anthropological constant, a pattern in father–son relationships (son’s rebellion, estrangement, reconciliation) that repeats itself from generation to generation in all societies. The essays overall are arranged in five groups, with headings intended to characterise and distinguish them – ‘D’Orient en Occident’, ‘Les recueils de fables enchâssées, une tradition occidentale’, ‘Les fables et leurs métamorphoses’, ‘Manuscrits et enchâssements’, ‘A l’aube des *Mille et une Nuits*’ – but which are actually rather imprecise and unclear. The five groups would benefit from brief separate introductions to clarify their specific place within the total collection of essays. The most helpful outline of the contents and function of the book is provided in the Foreword by Hans Runte. I translate: ‘The following pages will examine in careful detail what happened to the texts in their movements and the consequent variety of interpretations to which they lend themselves. The essays are notably concerned with such questions as the origins of the collections, their migration, their transmission (from Indian Buddhism, for instance, to Zoroastrianism, to Islam, from there to the Christian world), and their diffusion. They are likewise concerned with interpretations of the collections, constantly renewed under the influence of political imperatives or particular didactics. The body of erudite knowledge here establishes connections with areas of interest to today’s academic readers, revealing links between the cultures that are often centuries old.’

It is hard to pick out outstanding essays in this assemblage of exceptional quality. Partly from their position as opening and final essays, Barry Taylor’s and Olivier Azam’s contributions are likely to remain in one’s mind. Taylor establishes a broad East–West perspective at the beginning, and sensibly maintains that scholars who know Arabic and Hebrew are the most likely to discern genetic connections between Eastern and Western literatures. Azam’s essay traces the long history of Barlaam and Josaphat in Russia, from the time of the first Romanovs to the abridged version authorised for the Orthodox Russian Church in 2003, pointing out en route Tolstoy’s use of the story in his *A Confession*.

JOHN BESTON, *The University of Queensland*

**Walls, Kathryn**, *God's Only Daughter: Spenser's Una as the Invisible Church* (The Manchester Spenser), Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2013; hardback; pp. 288; 8 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. £70.00; ISBN 9780719090370.

Kathryn Walls's ground-breaking study challenges the established criticism of Una in *Book One* of *The Faerie Queene*. In the Introduction, Walls adumbrates the three main parts to her thesis. She argues that Una undergoes an unspecified transformation in which its textual absence is its most important feature. The implication of this transformation is the basis for Walls's second point that Una needs redeeming. Once born again, Walls further argues that Una does not represent the Elizabethan Church, but St Augustine's 'City of God' as the invisible Divine Church.

Chapter 1 discusses Una's fallibility. Walls reassesses the standard interpretation that Una represents 'truth' and unchanging purity. Even with critics who accept Una is fallible, Walls goes further to argue 'that fallibility is Una's defining characteristic' (p. 20). She begins by reinterpreting Una's famous injunction to the tired Red Cross to add faith to his force while battling Errour. However, Walls does not attribute Red Cross's eventual victory over Errour to Una's injunction as spiritual intervention. She states instead that Una simply boosts Red Cross's confidence.

The second half of the chapter re-examines the episode where Red Cross and Una take shelter in the wandering wood. By fleeing from a storm Walls interprets as Noah's Flood, she argues that both Una and Red Cross are sinful. What makes Walls's argument more convincing is that Una's naming of the wandering wood and Errour's den leads to the inference 'that Una has been here before' (p. 32). Therefore, along with Red Cross, Una must also be in spiritual error. It is also telling that Una is not named until near the end of the first canto, and then it is only in connection with Archimago's false Una. Walls points out that leaving Una unnamed until this moment is consistent with the impression that she is not perfect.

In Chapter 2, Walls breaks new critical ground by stating that Una is transformed when she wakes up from her bed and then chamber before leaving Archimago's house. She argues persuasively that the creation of the false Una and the flight of Red Cross, who is false himself through being deceived by Archimago's model, constitute Una's redemption. Walls then discusses Una's submissive lion as 'the Incarnation of Christ (and its death the Crucifixion)' (p. 49). Following her own logic, Walls argues that Una is also Mary as the first member of the Christian Church. Walls is careful to add, though, that Una does not simply represent an individual Christian or the Elizabethan church, but more specifically she signifies the redeemed of the True Church.

Chapter 3 analyses Una as representing the City of God in more detail, especially through how Augustine developed his ideas from biblical sources that also influenced Spenser. With reference to an invisible Church, Walls ascertains through the House of Holiness that holiness for Spenser was not linked to buildings. Chapter 4 examines Spenser's use of figurative biblical history. Walls argues that this history has an allegorical impact on Una's meeting with Abessa who 'moves through three time zones' (p. 83). Walls also argues that the sequence of events leading up to and including Abessa's flight to her mother's cottage are steeped in biblical allusion. She then reconsiders the implications of Una failing to recognise Archimago.

Chapter 5 rereads the significance of the fauns and satyrs. Walls argues that they signify the pagans from the Acts of the Apostles who are converted to Christianity by the early Church. Chapter 6 focuses on Una's dwarf, the importance of whom, especially to Una, Walls contends has been completely overlooked by critics.

In Chapter 7, Walls extends her thesis that Una represents the invisible Church by adding she also echoes God as the Holy Trinity. In particular, she argues that the ass, lamb, and lion with which Una is associated signify her embodiment of the Trinity. Chapter 8 examines how Una's allies and supporters are extensions of her representation of the invisible Church. In the Conclusion, Walls reflects on the widespread critical misconceptions of Una. She ends her book by stating that Una as the body of the redeemed is ultimately a descendant of the fallen Adam and Eve.

Walls's book is not only crucial to Spenserians, but to all early modern academics and students. *God's Only Daughter: Spenser's Una as the Invisible Church* serves as an unflinching reflection on how criticism is built on less rigorous arguments and how insights that initially appear accurate also spawn further inaccuracies. Wall's reinterpretation of Una and rereading of *Book One* is an indispensable companion to *The Faerie Queen*.

FRANK SWANNACK, *The University of Salford*

**Wolf**, Anne Marie, *Juan de Segovia and the Fight for Peace: Christians and Muslims in the Fifteenth Century* (History, Languages, and Cultures of the Spanish and Portuguese Worlds), Notre Dame, University of Notre Dame Press, 2014; paperback; pp. xi, 375; R.R.P. US\$45.00; ISBN 9780268044251.

The fifteenth-century Spanish theologian, Juan de Segovia, is well known to everyone who is interested in the conciliar movement, especially at the Council of Basel. In the Anglophone world, this is due to the work of Antony Black and his classic *Council and Commune* (Burns & Oates, 1979), which first systematically highlighted Juan's contributions to Basel conciliarism. Although Jesse D. Mann produced a series of important articles in the 1990s,

it is clear that there has been a lull in the research on the Spanish conciliarist for the last couple of decades.

Anne Marie Wolf's new book is a much-needed study that approaches Juan from a fresh perspective. As the subtitle suggests, the book's main focus is Juan's discussion of the relationship between Christians and Muslims. The main aim of the book is to demonstrate how Juan's approach to the question of Christian–Muslim relations 'intersects both with his other endeavours, especially church reform and the Council of Basel's discussions with the Hussites, and with cultural and intellectual movements at play in the fifteenth century'. Wolf's contribution does not merely shed light on a hitherto underexplored aspect of Juan's thought; it also reveals the connections between his discussions of Christian–Muslim relations and his ecclesiological views. She accomplishes this successfully.

Wolf narrates various stages of Juan's life and thought by delineating the wide range of communications and conversations that took place between Juan and his contemporaries. Packed with rich biographical details excavated from various manuscript sources, the book at times reads like an intellectual biography. Emphasis is given to demonstrate that Juan 'was remarkably consistent in his pattern of thought and the positions he argued' (p. 10). Thus, early chapters argue with considerable success that seminal ideas, which he developed in later years, were found in his early works. Chapter 1 discusses Juan's scholarly and administrative activities at the University of Salamanca during and shortly after the time of the Council of Constance. One of the problems Wolf tackles is the authorial intention of *Repetitio de superioritate* (1426). The work has long puzzled modern historians because Juan, who is known for his later adherence to conciliarism, presents a pro-papal claim in that work. Wolf's careful contextualisation reveals that *Repetitio's* pro-papal stance was intended to defend the autonomy of the University of Salamanca from the powerful influence of the Archbishop of Santiago, Lope de Mendoza. Despite its ostensible 'papalist' claim, Wolf argues that Juan's defence of the corporate autonomy of the university shows greater affinity with his future conciliar principles.

Likewise, Chapter 2 examines Juan's early encounters with Muslims in Castile in the 1420s, in which Wolf traces the origin of Juan's future commitment to conversion of Muslims through dialogue. Juan's actual conversations with Muslims made him aware of their prevalent misunderstanding of Christianity. Juan's conviction with dialogical engagement with the religious 'other' is also at the root of his successful negotiations with the Hussites, which is the focus of Chapter 3: conversion of heretics through dialogue provided a model for his later negotiations with Muslims. Thus, Juan's peace plan for the conflict with Islam, Wolf shows in the remainder of the book, derives not only from his learning but also from his life experience.

Wolf insists that Juan de Segovia deserves to be known much better. While his thought, which remains to be discovered more fully, may be 'bold and provocative' (p. 231), one might wonder why such an original thinker fell into oblivion for centuries immediately after his lifetime. Wolf's close focus on Juan's contemporary contexts beautifully shows Juan's originality, putting in sharp relief the contrast between him and his contemporary thinkers, such as Nicholas of Cusa. However, she does not tell the reader much about the historical significance of Juan in the broader chronological context of intellectual, ecclesiastical, and political history but only notes, drawing on Antony Black, that Juan's ideas will help to demonstrate continuity between medieval and modern political thought. Wolf's occasional accounts of the relationship between Juan's ideas and those of his predecessors in the previous century or of successors in the following hardly rely on her own reading of primary texts. For instance, Wolf's discussion on Juan's indebtedness to Ockham is entirely based on Jesse Mann's (admirable) work. The visionary Epilogue hints at some promising avenues of future research, which Wolf will hopefully undertake in the near future.

Overall, *Juan de Segovia and the Fight for Peace* is an engaging and important contribution to intellectual and ecclesiastical history of the fifteenth century. Wolf portrays the Spanish theologian's struggle for peace between Christians and Muslims vividly and affectionately. Anyone who is interested in inter-faith dialogue in the late Middle Ages cannot afford to miss this book. And one cannot deny that the story of Juan's pursuit of peace contains powerful contemporary relevance.

TAKASHI SHOGIMEN, *The University of Otago*

**Yeo, Richard**, *Notebooks, English Virtuosi, and Early Modern Science*, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2014; cloth; pp. 284; 17 b/w illustrations; R.R.P. US\$45.00; ISBN 9780226106564 (review copy supplied by Footprint Books).

Richard Yeo's latest monograph is the first to offer an in-depth analysis of the notes and notebooks of several key figures of the Scientific Revolution, including Robert Boyle, John Locke, Robert Hooke, and John Evelyn, all of whom were important members of the Royal Society of London. They used the Renaissance humanist method of 'excerpting from texts to build storehouses of proverbs, maxims, quotations and other material in personal notebooks', culminating in "commonplace" books', so named as they centred 'in a common place, under subject or topic headings' (p. xii). These English virtuosi created their own scholarly archives on a variety of pertinent topics, upon which they – and often others – could draw, leaving a lasting influence on scientific inquiry via their notes and notebooks.

Yeo's ground-breaking book offers insight into the often overlooked importance of such notes, both the writing and the using of them. He reveals the tension that exists between writing and memory: 'notes can preserve a tiny part of a lost whole, or act as pithy condensations of ideas never fully committed to paper. Notes work to jog the memory of those who make them, or serve as records for others, including future generations' (p. xi). Yeo uses references from scientific 'moderns', like René Descartes and Michel de Montaigne, to justify the dedication of an entire book to notes. Neither Montaigne nor Descartes held memory in high esteem. Montaigne admitted his was an 'untrustworthy sieve' and, as such, 'could not take on any commission without ... [his] ... jotter'. In 1648, Descartes advocated to Frans Burman, a Dutch theology student, that one should "test" oneself in order to see if one is "good at remembering", fully recognising the limits of memory. He advocated the use of notes as a 'necessary support' (p. 39) to one's work.

According to Yeo, notes and notebooks acted as 'talismans', providing important insights into the 'underpinnings of a published text' (p. xi). They were also imperative to those studying subjects whose applicable resources had not yet been collected, collated, and documented. In the seventeenth century, dictionaries and encyclopaedias only provided 'starting point[s]' for the newest subjects. Those researching these topics 'had to embark on the laborious and long-term search for material not yet collected or collated, as well as comparing this to that currently available' (p. 70). Even by today's standards, the virtuosi were incredibly prolific; notes, the creation of archives, and the sharing of notes assisted in their endeavours.

By focusing on the surviving notes, notebooks, and letters in the papers of select seventeenth-century English intellectual figures, Yeo is able to demonstrate the new ways in which these intellectuals created new methods of managing materials both to aid memory and stimulate inquiry. He explores the types of notes and notebooks used in early modern Europe and historical understandings of the interconnecting links between memory, thinking, and notes; the act of note-taking itself, including methods and purposes of note-taking; how thinking about notes changed the emerging empirical sciences; personal archives, which included diaries, letters, network correspondences, and papers; and, finally, the concept of 'collective note-taking', which not only required its participants to 'establish an archive that received material from various sources, but also to direct and regulate the ways in which information could be sought cooperatively and stored for future use', with certain 'protocols, and incentives' enacted to entice implementation (p. 219). Like today's Internet catalogues and databases, 'collective notebooks' were seen as a "bank" of information, growing richer and more effective over time' (p. 253), with its usage and reach ever expanding.



This important book serves to highlight our dependence on institutional archival systems, which were only in their infancy for the likes of the English virtuosi. Yeo has expertly demonstrated that the development of notes and note-taking by the virtuosi had profound and long-lasting effects on scientific inquiry and the Scientific Revolution. In doing so, he has also underscored the importance we place on these resources today; we would not have them if this early note-taking had not occurred.

PATRICIA ALESSI, *The University of Western Australia*

**Zori**, Davide, and Jesse **Byock**, eds, *Viking Archaeology in Iceland: Mosfell Archaeological Project* (Cursor Mundi, 20), Turnhout, Brepols, 2014; paperback; pp. xxvi, 256; 10 colour, 83 b/w illustrations, 17 maps, 23 graphs, 28 b/w tables; R.R.P. €120.00; ISBN 9782503544007.

This large-format volume presents the findings of the Mosfell Archaeological Project, commenced in the 1990s and still ongoing at the time of the publication of the book now under consideration. The project has uncovered what has been identified as a Viking chieftain's farmstead in the Mosfell Valley, about twenty kilometres from Reykjavík. Apart from the residential building, a longhouse, the excavators have discovered what they identify as a pagan cremation site, a conversion era stave church, and a Christian graveyard. In sixteen chapters, an international team of twenty-three scholars presents a remarkably wide-ranging account of the site. The claim in the cover blurb that the project 'incorporates the disciplines of archaeology, history, saga studies, osteology, zoology, palaeobotany, genetics, isotope studies, place names studies, environmental science, and historical architecture' is a boast amply justified. The volume moves beyond narrowly focused archaeological reporting to a consideration of what the Mosfell site can suggest regarding the initial centuries of settlement in Iceland (up to the thirteenth century but with the main focus on the ninth to eleventh centuries) and Icelandic interactions with a wider world.

Though, curiously, there is no overt indication of it elsewhere in the book, the introductory chapter by Jesse Byock and Davide Zori indicates that the chapters are organised into five sections: I: Archaeology and History; II: Bioarchaeology, Human Health and Diet; III: Artefacts; IV: Environmental Archaeology; and V: Travel, Trade and Communication. Readers of *Parergon* more at home in the disciplines of history and literature than in the natural sciences will probably find the first and fifth sections of most interest, especially Chapters 3 and 4 in Section I. In Chapter 3, Byock argues vigorously that earlier archaeologists and historians were wrong to downplay or ignore what medieval texts have to say: 'In undertaking the Mosfell archaeology, we have found our use of Iceland's medieval written texts valuable. ... we have rejected an outmoded view of Iceland's medieval histories and sagas'

(p. 41). In Chapter 4, Byock, Zori, and Jón Erlandsson consider a grave site in the light of what is related in *Egils saga Skallagrímsson*. Their report is certainly fascinating, and the conclusion cautious: 'Was the empty grave beneath the altar of the church at Hrísbú the temporary resting place of Egill Skallagrímsson's bones? The best we can say is that there are a series of extraordinary correlations between the archaeological evidence and the saga account' (p. 52). But while one might well agree that the complete rejection of saga evidence displayed in the work of the influential Icelandic historian Jón Jóhannesson was excessive, it is well also to remember why, during much of the twentieth century, archaeologists avoided an approach guided by the saga texts, which in the past had led too often to over-hasty and unconvincing identifications of pagan temples, battle sites, burnings, and so on.

Sections II, III, and IV provide scientific papers employing the methodologies of a variety of natural sciences. The papers are accessible to those not specialist in the relevant disciplines, though such readers will probably be unable to make an informed evaluation of the methodologies and conclusions. There are certainly some interesting findings: horse meat apparently continued to be consumed for some time after the conversion to Christianity, for example, and 'intentional land-use transformation' (p. 190) seems to have begun in the area shortly before the deposition of the so-called 'landnám tephra', dated to c. 871.

The final two chapters, making up the fifth section, restore the historian to more familiar ground: there is an interesting essay on routes, landscape, and power in the area, and an essay on Hedeby in the Danish-northern German borderland which seems of limited relevance to the rest of the volume.

Well illustrated with photographs, tables, and charts, the book seems intended for readers seriously interested in the site and its implications but not necessarily specialists in medieval Icelandic studies. Historical and literary matters likely to be known to such specialists are explained, and saga texts are translated. But although reading the book from cover to cover will probably bring most students into contact with some essays they find less interesting, the overall experience will provide valuable, sometimes novel, and often stimulating insights into an important site and the early centuries of settlement in Iceland.

JOHN KENNEDY, *Charles Sturt University*

